

Annotated Translation of Sutras from the Chinese Samyuktagama relevant to the Early Buddhist Teachings on Emptiness and the Middle Way

(Second revised edition)

中英对照译注 杂(雜) 阿含经中有关早期佛教空与中道的经典

(第二修订版)

煒傑 CHOONG Mun-keat (Wei-keat)

Annotated Translation of Sūtras from the Chinese Saṃyuktāgama relevant to the Early Buddhist Teachings on Emptiness and the Middle Way
(Second revised edition)

中英对照译注
杂(雜)阿含经中有关早期佛教空与中道的经典
(第二修订版)

by

煒 傑
CHOONG Mun-keat (Wei-keat)

First Edition 初版 2004: Published by Lu Ye Chan Si 鹿野禪寺;
distributed by Persatuan Penganut Agama Buddha, Xin Lian Jing She
金蓮淨舍佛教學會 (Johor, Malaysia)

Second Edition 第二版 2010: Published by
International Buddhist College, Songkhla
88, Mu 2, Thung Mo Subdistrict, Khuan Sato, Amphoe Sadao,
Songkhla 90240, Thailand

International Buddhist College, Nakhon Ratchasima
442/1, Mu 1, Thumbol Muang Pak, Amphoe Pak Thong Chai,
Nakhon Ratchasima 30150, Thailand

http://ibc.ac.th/en/
e-mail: enquire@ibc.ac.th

ISBN: 978-616-202-126-8

Printed by
CHEONG SENG CHAN SDN. BHD.
Plot 10, Lorong Industri Ringan Satu,
Juru Light Industrial Estate,
14100 Juru, Penang, Malaysia.
Tel: 604-501 1711 Fax: 604-501 1717

Website: www.cscsb.com.my
Email: cbs.csc@gmail.com

Contents 目錄

Foreword

The entire contents of the Pali Sutta-Piṭaka have long been available in English translation, but the corresponding contents of the Chinese Buddhist canon remain, for the most part, inaccessible to the English-reading public. A project is under way that may eventually see the Chinese āgamas translated, in their entirety, into English. In the meantime, however, interested readers who are not literate in Chinese have to rely on the still very small number of translations of individual sutras being produced by a few dedicated monks and scholars. The present book makes a substantial contribution to that process, by presenting thirteen significant sutras from the Chinese canon, with Chinese text and English translation conveniently set out in parallel columns.

All of the sutras translated here are from the Chinese Saṃyuktāgama, a text thought to represent the Sarvāstivāda or the Mūlasarvāstivāda tradition. Most are from the Nidāna-saṃyukta. Of the thirteen sutras, seven have counterparts in the Pali Saṃyutta-nikāya, one is represented in Pali in the Majjhima-nikāya and one in the Aṅguttara-nikāya, and four have no known Pali counterparts. Consequently, this small collection not only opens the way for comparison of Chinese sutras with their Pali counterparts; it also provides access to sutras that, for one reason or another, are not represented in the Pali canon.

Importantly, eight of the Chinese sutras (including three of those that are unknown in Pali) exist also in Sanskrit: they have been identified in a manuscript excavated at Turfan. Close resemblances between the Chinese and Sanskrit versions indicate that these Sanskrit remains reflect closely the source text from which the Chinese translation was made (in the 5th century CE).

Doctrinally, these sutras form a natural group: they all deal with the important topic of emptiness. Indeed, this

collection originated as one aspect of a comparative study of that topic. There is a growing recognition that, whatever the doctrinal issue, comparison of a Pali sutra with its Chinese counterpart can reveal instructive patterns of agreement and disagreement. A large part of the value of this book is that it draws attention to the potential for such Pali-Chinese comparative study.

When CHOONG Mun-keat began this translation work during his postgraduate studies at the University of Queensland, I welcomed it as a valuable aspect of the research he was then engaged in. Now that it has appeared as a published book, I welcome it as a substantial contribution to the on-going process of making the Chinese āgamas accessible to the non-Chinese reading public.

Roderick S. BUCKNELL
School of History, Philosophy, Religion, and Classics
The University of Queensland, Australia

Preface

The sutra translations presented in this book go back to the time when I was doing my MA in the Department of Studies in Religion at The University of Queensland (1993-4). At that time I selected this material for translation because it was particularly relevant to my proposed MA thesis, titled "The Notion of Emptiness in Early Buddhism".

That thesis, without the sutra translations, has since appeared as a book, first published in 1995 in Singapore, and then, in a second revised edition, in 1999 in Delhi by Motilal Banarsidass. I always had in mind that my translations of those important early Buddhist sutras should one day be revised for publication as a book for the benefit of both English and Chinese readers. This dream has come true. The first edition of this book was published in 2004 through the support of Ven. Miao Sheng (妙勝). Now this second revised edition has been made possible by the support of Ven. Wei Wu (唯悟). Here I would like to express my gratitude for their support of my work.

With regard to the first edition of this book, I would like to say thanks to Professors Alan Atkinson and Majella Franzmann at the University of New England, who encouraged me to apply for a UNE Internal Research Grant for this project. I am particularly indebted to Professor Alan Atkinson for suggesting improvements to my ultimately successful IRG application.

Finally, I would also like to acknowledge gratefully the help I have received from my teacher, Dr Rod Bucknell. He not only was my teacher at UQ during my MA and PhD studies, but also gave me essential support during the publication process.

CHOONG Mun-keat (Wei-keat)
School of Humanities
University of New England, Australia

序

这本书为中英对照译注，有关「空与中道」教义的经文，是从『杂阿含经』中选出。『杂阿含经』是佛教界早期结集的经典，代表了佛陀在世时期的佛法实态。佛法的根本，是以修行为主，是简要，平实，中正的，依世间而觉悟世间，实现出世的理想 – 涅般。『杂阿含经』是佛教教法的根源。在世间流传的佛教圣典中，包括部派佛教（小乘佛教）分化，大乘佛教之中观及瑜伽的教义，都可从这部经中发现其渊源。这是每一位修学佛法者所应阅读的圣典。有关这部经的根本教义，请读者参阅我的著作：『原始佛教的根本教学：比较研究巴利文相应部及杂阿含经中的修多罗部分』（*The Fundamental Teachings of Early Buddhism: A comparative study based on the Sūtrāṅga portion of the Pāli Saṃyutta-Nikāya and the Chinese Saṃyuktāgama*）。此书曾是我的博士论文（在昆士兰大学宗教学系）。

空（包括中道）是被认为初期大乘佛教的中心哲学。其实，空的哲理，根源于初期的，早期的佛教（原始佛教）。它的主要意义是，空于我执，空于有无两极端（中道），与及空于烦恼悲痛（涅槃）。其主要的实践方法是，观察一切身心现象的真相，为因缘所生法，是无常、苦、无我，而达到空于我执，空于有无两极端，与及空于烦恼悲痛的涅槃境界。这种观察，是八正（圣）道中的正见。八正道（正見，正思惟，正語，正業，正命，正精进，正念，正定）是根本佛法之四圣谛（苦集灭道）中的道谛。因此，佛法的空，是实践的哲学，不是空谈，非悲观乐观，而是身心现象的真实观。有关这方面的祥细内容，读者可请参阅我的另一著作：『原始佛教的空』（*The Notion of Emptiness in Early Buddhism*）。此书曾是我的硕士论文（昆士兰大学宗教学系）。

能够在马来西亚出版这本与佛学有关的书，对我来说，意义深远。因为我是在槟城马来西亚佛学院，首次接触了佛教(1973-77)。这是我对佛学感兴趣的开始，也是我的人生转折点。我礼已故修静法师为师（法名惟傑，后改煒傑）。然后为了研究佛学,我到了台湾（1979-81）、斯里兰卡（1982）的佛学院留学。我又到日本东京留学（1984），并在駒澤大学佛教学部，取得文学士（1986-90）。我继续又到澳大利亚留学（1990），并在昆士兰大学的宗教学系，取得文学硕士（1993-4）及哲学博士学位（1995-99），主修是佛学。目前我是在澳大利亚的新英格兰大学，当任宗教与佛学的大学教师（2003-）。我在马来西亚出生，首次在马来西亚接触到了佛教，经过了很长的一段岁月，今在马来西亚出版流通我的佛学作品，对我来说，很有意义。

此书之译注工作，可起源于我攻读硕士学位的时期。当时是为了学位之学分及写硕士论文而做的预备工作。为了利益中英读者，我一直想把已译注的重要经文，重新修订出版成书。这一理想已经实现。此书的第一版本，是得到妙胜法师的支持。现在的第二修订版本，是得到唯悟法师的支持。在这里我要表达对他们的真诚感激与敬意。

我希望此书，能为佛教、佛学界及大众一般，带来有阅读的价值。谨祝各位，福慧增胜，身心安康。

煒傑 Wei-keat (CHOONG Mun-keat)
School of Humanities
University of New England
Arimidale, Australia

Abbreviations

BCE	Before Common Era, i.e. BC
c.	"circa", approximately
CE	Common Era, i.e. AD
CSA	雜阿含經論會編 (印順編) [Combined Edition of *Sūtra* and *Śāstra* of the *Saṃyuktāgama*] (3 vols, 1983)
FSA	佛光大藏經, 雜阿含經 *Saṃyuktāgama* in Foguang *Tripiṭaka* (4 vols, 1983)
Lamotte	Étienne Lamotte, "Trois Sūtra du Saṃyukta sur la Vacuité" *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, 36 (1973), pp. 313-323
P.	Pali or Pāli
PTS	The Pali Text Society, London
Skt.	Sanskrit
T	大正大藏經 (Taishō Chinese *Tripiṭaka*), 1924-1932 (the standard edition for most scholarly purposes)
Tripāṭhī	Chandrabhāl Tripāṭhī, *Fünfundzwanzig Sūtras des Nidānasaṃyukta* (Akademie-Verlag, Berlin, 1962)

Introduction

The teaching of Emptiness (including the Middle Way) is well known as the central philosophy of early Mahāyāna Buddhism. This teaching in fact exists in both early Buddhism and early Mahāyāna Buddhism, where it is connected with the meaning of "empty of self-attachment", "empty of the two extremes (the Middle Way)", and "empty of suffering, affliction, and distress".[1] The translations presented here are of selections from the Chinese Buddhist text, *Za-ahan Jing* (雜阿含經),[2] which is itself a translation of a lost Sanskrit text, *Saṃyuktāgama*. The following paragraphs explain my reasons for choosing this material for translation, and provide essential background to the text itself.

The thirteen Chinese sūtras translated here are important early Buddhist materials.[3] They deal with the essential early Buddhist doctrine of Emptiness and the

---

[1] Details on this Emptiness teaching in early Buddhism can be found in my work, *The Notion of Emptiness in Early Buddhism* (Singapore, 1995; Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi, 1999). Reviewed by Roderick S. BUCKNELL, *Australian Religion Studies Review*, vol. 13, No. 1 (Autumn 2000), pp. 100-102.

[2] Taishō vol. 2, text number 99.

[3] Choong (1999), pp. 4-5; *The Fundamental Teachings of Early Buddhism: A comparative study based on the Sūtrāṅga portion of the Pāli Saṃyutta-Nikāya and the Chinese Saṃyuktāgama* (= Beiträge zur Indologie 32) (Harrassowitz Verlag, Wiesbaden, 2000), pp. 7-11.

Middle Way.

The translation from Sanskrit into Chinese was done by the monk Guṇabhadra (求那跋陀羅) between 435 and 445 CE; the original Sanskrit text was subsequently lost. That Sanskrit text, the *Saṃyuktāgama*, is considered to be the Sarvāstivādin (or perhaps Mūla-Sarvāstivādin) counterpart of the Pali *Saṃyutta-nikāya* of the Tāmraśāṭīya tradition (Sri Lankan Pali Buddhism), the self-styled "Theravāda Buddhism", Teaching of the Elders. It is widely assumed that only the Pali canon represents "early Buddhism". However, the Pali canon, the scripture of the Theravāda or southern Buddhist tradition, represents only one of the early Buddhist schools (so-called "Hīnayāna Buddhism"), traditionally numbering eighteen. It is not necessarily more representative of early Buddhism than any of the other schools produced by the schisms (beginning about a century after the Buddha's death) whereby the tradition divided and subdivided along sectarian lines. The canons of those other schools are not entirely inaccessible. Although the Indic source texts have been largely lost, there exist complete Chinese translations of all four āgamas (collections). They are indispensable sources for the study of early Buddhism. In other words, in studies of early Buddhism it is essential to consider not only the Pali canon but also its counterparts from other schools, as preserved in Chinese.[4] Hence, it is important to study the Chinese version of the *Saṃyuktāgama*.

The text of the Chinese *Saṃyuktāgama* used for this translation is that presented as text number 99 in volume 2

---

[4] Choong (2000), pp. 6-7.

(pp. 1-373) of the Taishō *Tripiṭaka*. The Taishō edition of the Chinese Buddhist canon is widely recognised as the standard edition for academic study of Chinese Buddhist texts. The whole set (vols. 1-55 and 85, out of one hundred volumes) is more comprehensive and systematic than any previous compilation.

I also made use of Yin Shun's *Za-ahan Jing-lun Huibian* (雜阿含經論會編) [Combined Edition of *Sūtra* and *Śāstra* of the *Saṃyuktāgama*] (March 1983, three vols.) (abbreviated CSA) and of the Foguang Tripiṭaka's *Za-ahan Jing* (August 1983, four vols.) (FSA). These are new editions of the Chinese *Saṃyuktāgama*, with textual corrections, modern Chinese punctuation, comments, and up-to-date information on Pali and other textual counterparts, including different Chinese versions of the text. According to Yin Shun, the existing Chinese version of the *Saṃyuktāgama* is in disorder with regard to the arrangement of its parts, and two fascicles of the original fifty have been lost. In his new edition, Yin Shun restores the supposed original arrangement.[5] Most of the sūtras of the *Saṃyuktāgama* have Pali counterparts, though not necessarily in the *Saṃyutta-nikāya*, and not always with entirely the same content. Of the thirteen sūtras translated here, nine have Pali counterparts, as indicated in footnotes.

The *Saṃyuktāgama* has never been translated into English. Therefore, although the present translation covers only thirteen sūtras out of the total of 1362 (Taishō edition), it is important in making this material collectively available in English for the first time. The published English

---

[5] Choong (2000), pp. 243-247.

translations of the Pali canon were naturally a valuable reference in translating those Chinese sūtras which have Pali counterparts.

Fragmentary Sanskrit counterparts of the selected Chinese sūtras, reconstructed and published mainly by Tripāṭhi and Lamotte, are not covered in this translation, but are mentioned in footnotes. The Sanskrit equivalents of Chinese terms are shown in footnotes in some cases.

Linguistically, the Chinese of the *Saṃyuktāgama* is intermediate between classical Chinese and modern vernacular Chinese. It includes numerous Buddhist technical terms, most of them translations from the Sanskrit, others phonetic transcriptions. Because of their importance for Buddhist scholarship, and because of occasional uncertainty as to the correct English equivalent, some of these terms have been included in footnotes to the translation in their Sanskrit and/or Pali forms.

The Taishō text is punctuated. However, as the above-mentioned two new editions have shown, this punctuation is sometimes incorrect. Consequently, the modern punctuation given in the new editions was a useful guide in preparing this English translation with annotations.

1. 空三昧禪住 The meditative abode of emptiness-concentration: 淸淨乞食住經 Discourse on Abiding in Purity of Alms-food[1]

T 2 (Taishō Tripiṭaka, vol. 2.), p. 57b, sūtra No. 236.[2]

如是我聞。	Thus have I heard.
一時。佛住舍衛國祇樹給孤獨園。	At one time the Buddha was staying at Jetavana, Anāthapiṇḍika's park at Śrāvastī.[3]
爾時。尊者舍利弗晨朝著衣持鉢。入舍衛城乞食。	Then, in the morning, the venerable Śāriputra, having put on his [outer] robe and taken his bowl, went into the town of Śrāvastī for alms-food.
乞食已。還精舍。舉衣	Having received alms-food, he returned to the

[1] This title is not in the text; it is given here for convenience as a label. The same applies also for the remaining translations.
[2] Majjhima-nikāya 151 Piṇḍapātapārisuddhi-sutta (vol. iii, pp. 293-297 in the PTS Pali edition). Ekottarāgama 45. 6 (T 2, p. 773b-c). CSA vol. 1, pp. 280-281; FSA vol. 1, pp. 370-371.
[3] Pali (P.) Sāvatthī, Capital of Kosala.

缽。洗足已。持尼師檀。入林中。晝日坐禪。

monastery. After putting away his robe and bowl and washing his feet, he took a sitting mat and went into the forest for day-time seated meditation.

時。舍利弗從禪覺。詣世尊所。稽首禮足。退坐一面。爾時。佛告舍利弗。汝從何來。

When Śāriputra arose from meditation, he went to where the World-Honoured One (the Buddha) was. He respectfully saluted him by prostrating with his head to the ground and touching the feet of the Buddha, stepped back, and sat down at one side. Then, the Buddha asked Śāriputra: "From where have you come?"

舍利弗答言。世尊。從林中晝日坐禪來。

Śāriputra replied: "World Honoured One, I have come from day-time seated meditation in the forest."

佛告舍利弗。今入何等禪住。

The Buddha asked Śāriputra: "Into which meditative abode (meditative state) do you enter at this time?"

舍利弗白佛言。世尊。我今於林中入空三昧禪住。

Śāriputra answered the Buddha: "World-Honoured One, at this time in the forest I enter the meditative abode of emptiness-concentration."[4]

佛告舍利弗。善哉。善哉。舍利弗。汝今入上坐禪住而坐禪。

The Buddha said to Śāriputra: "Good, good, Śāriputra. In your seated meditation you are now entering the meditative abode of the Elders.[5]

若諸比丘欲入上座禪者。當如是學。

"If a monk[6] wishes to enter the meditative abode of the Elders, he should practise thus:

若入城時．若行乞食時．若出城時。當作是思惟。我今眼見色。頗起欲．恩愛．愛念著不。

"When going into the city, when receiving alms-food, and when leaving the city, he should reflect: Now, as my eyes see material forms,[7] do I always give rise to desire, love, craving,

[4] Sanskrit (Skt.) śūnyatā-samādhi.

[5] Skt. sthavira-vihāra? 上坐 = 上座

[6] Skt. Bhikṣu, P. Bhikkhu.

[7] P. rūpa.

attachment?

舍利弗。比丘作如是觀時。若眼識於色有愛念染著者。彼比丘為斷惡不善故。當勤欲方便。堪能繫念修學。

"Śāriputra, if in a monk, thus observing, visual consciousness of material form is accompanied by craving, longing and impure attachment, then in order to cut off evil, unskilful states, that monk should make an effort so that he is able to practise restraining the mind.

譬如有人。火燒頭衣。為盡滅故。當起增上方便。勤教令滅。彼比丘亦復如是。當起增上勤欲方便。繫念修學。

"Just as a man whose turban was on fire would make an effort to extinguish that fire, in the same way the monk should make an effort to practise restraining the mind.

若比丘觀察時。若於道路．若聚落中行乞食．若出聚落。於其中間。眼識於色。無有愛念染著者。

"If in a monk observing [his mind], whether on the road, or in the town receiving alms-food, or coming out of the town, visual consciousness of material form is without craving, longing, and impure attachment during that time,

彼比丘願以此喜樂善根。日夜精勤。繫念修習。

then that monk, wishing to maintain this skilful-root[8] of happiness, makes an effort and practices restraining the mind day and night.

是名比丘於行．住．坐．臥淨除乞食。是故此經名清淨乞食住。

"This is what is called a monk's purity of alms-food while walking, standing, sitting, and reclining. For this reason, this discourse is called 'abiding in purity of alms-food'."

佛說此經已。尊者舍利弗聞佛所說。歡喜奉行。

When the Buddha had taught this discourse, the venerable Śāriputra, having heard what the Buddha said, was delighted and put it into practice.

[8] Skt. kuśala-mūla, P. kusala-mūla.

2. 空相應緣起隨順法 Connected with emptiness, conformable to the dharma of conditioned genesis.

T 2, p. 83c, sūtra No. 293.[9]

如是我聞。	Thus have I heard.
一時。佛住王舍城迦蘭陀竹園。	Once the Buddha was staying in Kalandaka's bamboo-grove[10] at Rājagṛha.
爾時。世尊告異比丘。我已度疑。離於猶豫。拔邪見刺。不復退轉。心無所著故。何處有我。	Then, the World-Honoured One (the Buddha) said to certain monks: "I have transcended doubt, got away from uncertainty, dug out the thicket of evil views, and will no more turn back. Since the mind has nothing to which to attach, where could there be a self?
為彼比丘說法。為彼比丘說賢聖出世空相應緣起隨	I teach monks dharma (the nature of phenomena); I teach monks the noble, the

[9] No Pali counterpart. For Skt. version, see Tripāṭhi, Sūtra 11. CSA vol. 2, pp. 25-26; FSA vol. 1, pp. 563-564.
[10] P. veḷuvana.

順法。	supramundane,[11] connected with emptiness,[12] conformable to the dharma of conditioned genesis.[13]
所謂有是故是事有。是事有故是事起。	"That is to say: Because this exists, that exists; because this exists, that arises.
所謂緣無明行。緣行識。	"That is to say: Conditioned by ignorance,[14] activities[15] arise; conditioned by activities, consciousness[16] arises;
緣識名色。緣名色六入處。	conditioned by consciousness, name and material form[17] arise; conditioned by name and material form, the six

[11] Skt. loka-uttara, P. lokuttara.
[12] Skt. śūnyatā-pratisaṃyukta, P. suññatā-paṭisaṃyutta.
[13] Skt. pratītyasamutpādānulomatā. Cf. Choong (2000), pp. 197 and 154. Cf. also No. 7 in this book (sūtra No. 296).
[14] P. avijjā.
[15] P. saṃkhārā.
[16] P. viññāṇa.
[17] P. nāma-rūpa.

sense-spheres[18] arise;

緣六入處觸。緣觸受。

conditioned by the six sense-spheres, [sensorial and mental] contact[19] arises; conditioned by contact, feeling[20] arises;

緣受愛。緣愛取。

conditioned by feeling, craving[21] arises; conditioned by craving, attachment[22] arises;

緣取有。緣有生。

conditioned by attachment, becoming[23] arises; conditioned by becoming, birth[24] arises;

緣生老．死．憂．悲．惱苦。如是如是純大苦聚集。乃至如是純大苦聚滅。

conditioned by birth arises the suffering of aging, death, sorrow, and affliction. Thus is the origin of this whole mass of

---

[18] P. saḷāyatana.
[19] P. phassa.
[20] P. vedanā.
[21] P. taṇhā.
[22] P. upādāna.
[23] P. bhava.
[24] P. jāti.

suffering. And in the same way is the cessation of this whole mass of suffering.

如是說法。而彼比丘猶有疑惑猶豫。

"In this way, I teach dharma, but the monks still have doubt and uncertainty.

先不得得想. 不獲獲想. 不證證想。

"They cannot at first gain the perception that is to be gained, obtain the perception that is to be obtained, achieve the perception that is to be achieved.

今聞法已。心生憂苦. 悔恨. 矇沒. 障礙。所以者何。

"Now having heard the dharma, their minds give rise to sorrow, regret, unawareness, and obstacle. Why is this so?

此甚深處。所謂緣起。倍復甚深難見。所謂一切取離. 愛盡. 無欲. 寂滅. 涅槃。

"Profound[25] indeed is this, namely **conditioned genesis**; even more profound, more difficult to see (perceive) is this, namely the extinction of all attachment, the destruction

[25] P. gambhīra.

	of craving, the fading away of desire, cessation: **nirvāṇa**.[26]
如此二法。謂有為．無為。	"These two dharmas are namely the compounded[27] and the uncompounded.[28]
有為者若生．若住．若異．若滅。無為者不生．不住．不異．不滅。	"The compounded is arising, persisting, changing, passing away. The uncompounded is not arising, not persisting, not changing, not passing away.
是名比丘諸行苦寂滅涅槃。	"Monks, this is to say: All activities [compounded things] are suffering, and their cessation is nirvāṇa.
因集故苦集。因滅故苦滅。	"When the causes are there, suffering arises; when the causes cease, the suffering ceases.

[26] P. nibbāna, extinction of suffering.
[27] Skt. saṃskṛta, P. saṅkhata = conditioned genesis.
[28] Skt. asaṃskṛta, P. asaṃkhata = nirvāṇa.

斷諸逕路。滅於相續。相續滅滅。是名苦邊。	"All routes are cut off, the continuum ceases. The cessation of the continuum[29] is called the ending of suffering.
比丘。彼何所滅。謂有餘苦。彼若滅止．清涼．息沒。所謂一切取滅．愛盡．無欲．寂滅．涅槃。	"O monks! What is it that ceases? It is any remaining suffering. If this ceases, that is coolness, tranquillity, namely the extinction of all attachment, the destruction of craving, the fading away of desire, cessation: nirvāṇa."
佛說此經已。諸比丘聞佛所說。歡喜奉行。	When the Buddha had taught this discourse, all the monks, having heard what Buddha said, were delighted and put it into practice.

[29] The Taisho text has 滅滅; but I delete one 滅 (i.e. 相續滅), in accordance with CSA (vol. 2, p. 27).

3. 勝妙法 (正見中道) The excellent Dharma (Right view, the middle way)

T 2, pp. 66b-67a, sūtra No. 262.[30]

如是我聞。	Thus have I heard.
一時。有眾多上座比丘住波羅奈國仙人住處鹿野苑中。佛般泥洹未久。	At one time there were many senior monks staying in the deer-park at Ṛṣipatana[31] [near] Vārāṇasī,[32] soon after the passing away of the Buddha.
時。長老闡陀晨朝著衣持鉢。入波羅奈城乞食。	Then, in the morning, the elder Chanda, putting on his [outer] robe and taking his bowl, went into the city of Vārāṇasī for alms-food.
食已。還攝衣鉢。洗足已。持戶鉤。從林至林。從房至房。從經行處至經行處。處處請諸比丘言。	After eating, he put away his robe and bowl and washed his feet. Then, taking his door-key he went from grove to grove, from

[30] Saṃyutta-nikāya 22. 90 Channa (vol. iii, pp. 132-135). CSA vol. 1, pp. 53-56; FSA vol. 1, pp. 60-64.

[31] P. Isipatana.

[32] P. Bārāṇasī.

lodging to lodging, from walking place to walking place,[33] and to other places, and asked of the monks:

當教授我。為我說法。令我知法．見法。我當如法知．如法觀。

"Instruct me, teach me dharma, so that I may know dharma and see dharma! I will know according to dharma and observe according to dharma."

時。諸比丘語闡陀言。色無常。受．想．行．識無常。一切行無常。一切法無我。涅槃寂滅。

Then the monks said to Chanda: "Material form is impermanent;[34] feeling, perception,[35] activities, [and] consciousness are impermanent; all activities are impermanent; all dharmas[36] are non-self;[37] nirvāṇa is cessation."[38]

闡陀語諸比丘言。我已知色無常。受．想．行．識

Chanda said to those monks: "I know that

[33] Skt. caṅkramă, P. caṅkama.
[34] P. anicca.
[35] P. saññā.
[36] The nature of phenomena.
[37] P. anattā.
[38] P. nirodha.

無常。一切行無常。一切法無我。涅槃寂滅。

material form is impermanent; feeling, perception, activities, [and] consciousness are impermanent; all activities are impermanent; all dharmas are non-self; nirvāṇa is cessation."

闡陀復言。然我不喜聞。一切諸行空寂．不可得．愛盡．離欲．涅槃。

And he said: "But I am not delighted when I hear that all activities are empty,[39] not to be grasped at; and that the destruction of craving, the fading away of desire is nirvāṇa.

此中云何有我。而言如是知．如是見是名見法。

"In this case, what is meant by self? And what is meant by saying that to know thus and to see thus is to see dharma?"

第二．第三亦如是說。闡陀復言。是中誰復有力堪能為我說法。令我知法．見法。

A second time and third time, Chanda said the same. And then he asked: "Who is there here among you capable of teaching me

[39] 空寂, Skt. vivikta, which has the same meaning as śūnya or śūnyatā.

dharma, so that I may know dharma and see dharma?"

復作是念。尊者阿難今在拘睒彌國瞿師羅園。曾供養親覲世尊。佛所讚歎。諸梵行者皆悉識知。彼必堪能為我說法。令我知法見法。

Then he thought: "The venerable Ānanda is now staying in Ghosita park[40] at Kosambī. He attended on and closely served the World-Honoured One. He was praised by the Buddha, and is known to all practitioners of the noble life. He must be capable of teaching me dharma, so that I may know dharma and see dharma."

時。闡陀過此夜已。晨朝著衣持鉢。入波羅奈城乞食。

Then Chanda passed the night; and in the morning, having put on his [outer] robe and taken his alms-bowl, he went into the city of Vārāṇasī for alms-food.

食已。還攝舉臥具。攝臥具已。持衣鉢詣拘睒彌國。漸漸遊行到拘睒彌國。

After eating, he took up his bedding and put it away; then he took his robe and bowl, and set out for Kosambī. Travelling by

[40] P. Ghositārāma.

stages he reached Kosambī.

攝舉衣鉢。洗足已。詣尊者阿難所。共相問訊已。却坐一面。

Having put away his robe and bowl and washed his feet, he went to where the venerable Ānanda was, exchanged respectful greetings, and sat down at one side.

時。闡陀語尊者阿難言。

Then Chanda said to the venerable Ānanda:

一時。諸上座比丘住波羅奈國仙人住處鹿野苑中。時。我晨朝著衣持鉢入波羅奈城乞食。

"Once, senior monks were staying in the deer-park at Ṛṣipatana [near] Vārāṇasī. Then, in the morning, putting on my [outer] robe and taking my bowl, I went into the city of Vārāṇasī for alms-food.

食已。還攝衣鉢。洗足已。持戶鉤。從林至林。從房至房。從經行處至經行處。處處見諸比丘。而請之言。當教授我。為我說法。令我知法. 見法。

"After eating, I put away my robe and bowl and washed my feet. Then, taking my door-key, I went from grove to grove, from lodging to lodging, from walking place to walking place, and to other places, and asked of the monks: 'Instruct me, teach me

	dharma, so that I may know dharma and see dharma! I will know according to dharma and observe according to dharma.'
時。諸比丘為我說法言。色無常。受．想．行．識無常。一切行無常。一切法無我。涅槃寂滅。	"Then, the monks taught me dharma: 'Material form is impermanent; feeling, perception, activities, [and] consciousness are impermanent; all activities are impermanent; all dharmas are non-self; nirvāṇa is cessation.'
我爾時語諸比丘言。我已知色無常。受．想．行．識無常。一切行無常。一切法無我。涅槃寂滅。	"I then said to those monks: 'I know that material form is impermanent; feeling, perception, activities, [and] consciousness are impermanent; all activities are impermanent; all dharmas are non-self; nirvāṇa is cessation.
然我不喜聞。一切諸行空寂．不可得．愛盡．離欲．涅槃。	"But I am not delighted when I hear that all activities are empty, not to be grasped at; and that the destruction of craving, the

fading away of desire is nirvāṇa.

此中云何有我。而言如是知．如是見是名見法。

"In this case, what is meant by self? And what is meant by saying that to know thus and see thus is to see dharma?'

我爾時作是念。是中誰復有力堪能為我說法。令我知法．見法。

"Then I thought: 'Who is there capable of teaching me dharma, so that I may know dharma and see dharma?'

我時復作是念。尊者阿難今在拘睒彌國瞿師羅園。曾供養親覲世尊。佛所讚歎。諸梵行者皆悉知識。彼必堪能為我說法。令我知法．見法。

"And then I thought: 'The venerable Ānanda is now staying in Ghosita park at Kosambī. He attended on and closely served the World-Honoured One. He was praised by the Buddha, and is known to all practitioners of the noble life. He must be capable of teaching me dharma, so that I may know dharma and see dharma.'

善哉。尊者阿難今當為我說法。令我知法．見法。

"Good, venerable Ānanda! Now you should teach me dharma, so that I may know

dharma and see dharma."

時。尊者阿難語闡陀言。善哉。闡陀。我意大喜。我慶仁者能於梵行人前。無所覆藏。破虛偽刺。

Then, the venerable Ānanda said to Chanda: "Good, Chanda! My mind is delighted. I praise you as a benevolent one who is able to be open in the presence of a practitioner of the noble life, destroying the thicket of deception.

闡陀。愚癡凡夫所不能解色無常。受. 想. 行. 識無常。一切諸行無常。一切法無我。涅槃寂滅。

"O Chanda! an ignorant, ordinary person[41] does not understand that material form is impermanent; feeling, perception, activities, and consciousness are impermanent. All activities (compounded things) are impermanent; all dharmas (the nature of phenomena) are non-self; nirvāṇa is cessation.

汝今堪受勝妙法。汝今諦聽。當為汝說。

"Now you are capable of receiving the most excellent dharma.[42] Now

[41] P. puthujjana.

[42] 勝妙法.

	listen carefully while I teach you."
時。闡陀作是念。我今歡喜得勝妙心．得踊悅心。我今堪能受勝妙法。	At that time, Chanda thought: "Now I am delighted to have attained the most excellent mind, to have obtained a joyful mind. Now I am capable of receiving the most excellent dharma."
爾時。阿難語闡陀言。我親從佛聞。教摩訶迦旃延言。	Then, Ānanda said to Chanda: "I heard this myself from the Buddha when he was teaching Mahā-Katyāyana:[43]
世人顛倒依於二邊。若有．若無。	"Worldlings are confused, depending on two extremes: either existence or non-existence.
世人取諸境界。心便計著。	"Worldlings become attached to all spheres, setting store by and grasping with the mind.

[43] P. Mahā-Kaccāyana, Kaccāna.

迦旃延。若不受．不取．不住．不計於我。此苦生時生．滅時滅。

"Katyāyana! If one does not feel, nor attach to, nor dwell in, nor set store by self, then, when suffering arises, it arises; and when it ceases, it ceases.

迦旃延。於此不疑．不惑．不由於他而能自知。是名正見。如來所說。

"Katyāyana! If one does not doubt, is not perplexed, if one knows it in oneself and not from others, then that is right view,[44] the teaching of the Tathāgata (the Buddha).

所以者何。迦旃延。如實正觀世間集者。則不生世間無見。如實正觀世間滅。則不生世間有見。

"Why is this so? Katyāyana! If one sees rightly, as it really is, the arising of the world,[45] one will not have the annihilationist view of the world. If one sees rightly, as it really is, the cessation of the world,[46] one will not have the eternalist view of the world.

[44] P. sammā diṭṭhi.
[45] P. loka-samudaya.
[46] P. loka-nirodha.

迦旃延。如來離於二邊。說於中道。	"Katyāyana! The Tathāgata, avoiding these two extremes,[47] teaches the middle way,[48]
所謂此有故彼有。此生故彼生。	namely: When this is, that is; this arising, that arises.
謂緣無明有行。乃至生．老．病．死．憂．悲．惱．苦集。	"That is to say: Conditioned by ignorance, activities arise, and so on ..., and thus arises the suffering of birth, old age, sickness, death, sorrow, and affliction.
所謂此無故彼無。此滅故彼滅。	"As for the saying, 'when this is not, that is not; this ceasing, that ceases',
謂無明滅則行滅。乃至生．老．病．死．憂．悲．惱．苦滅。	this is to say: Ignorance ceasing, activities cease, and so on ..., and thus ceases the suffering of birth, old age, sickness, death, sorrow, and affliction."

[47] P. ubho antā.
[48] P. majjhimā paṭipadā.

尊者阿難說是法時。闡陀比丘遠塵離垢。得法眼淨。	When the venerable Ānanda had taught this dharma, the monk Chanda became freed from defilement and stain and acquired the pure dharma-eye.[49]
爾時。闡陀比丘見法．得法．知法．起法。超越狐疑。不由於他。於大師教法。得無所畏。	At that time, the monk Chanda saw dharma, attained dharma, knew dharma, realised dharma; transcended doubt [knowing it] not through another; in the dharma of the Great Teacher, he attained the state of fearlessness.
恭敬合掌白尊者阿難言。	Respectfully saluting by joining palms, he said to the venerable Ānanda:
正應如是。如是智慧梵行。善知識教授教誡說法。	"It is just so! As it is the noble life of wisdom, a good friend[50] teaches the discipline and the dharma.

[49] Skt. dharma-cakṣus, P. dhamma-cakkhu.
[50] Skt. kalyāṇa-mitra, P. kalyāṇa-mitta.

我今從尊者阿難所。聞如是法。於一切行皆空．皆悉寂．不可得．愛盡．離欲．滅盡．涅槃。

"Now, I have heard the dharma from the venerable Ānanda thus: All activities are empty, tranquil,[51] not to be grasped at; and the destruction of craving, the fading away of desire, cessation, is nirvāṇa.

心樂正住解脫。不復轉還。不復見我。唯見正法。時。阿難語闡陀言。

"The mind is joyful, one dwells rightly in liberation,[52] and there is no returning, no more seeing self; one sees only the true dharma."[53] Then Ānanda said to Chanda:

汝今得大善利。於甚深佛法中。得聖慧眼。

"Now you have attained great benefit in the profound Buddha-dharma, you have attained the wisdom-eye."

時。二正士展轉隨喜。從坐而起。各還本處。

Then the two noble ones, delighted with each other, rose from their seats, and returned each to his place.

---

[51] P. santa.
[52] Skt. vimukti, vimokṣa, P. vimutti, vimokkha.
[53] Skt. sad-dharma, P. sad-dhamma.

4. 空常見斷見 (中道) Empty of the eternalist and annihilationist views (The middle way)

T 2, p. 85c, sūtra No. 300.[54]

如是我聞。	Thus have I heard.
一時。佛住拘留搜調牛聚落。	At one time, the Buddha was staying in the cow-herding community of the Kurus.
時。有異婆羅門來詣佛所。與世尊面相慶慰。慶慰已。退坐一面。	At that time, a certain[55] brahmin[56] came to where the Buddha was, and exchanged greeting with the World-Honoured One. Having greeted him, he stepped back and sat down at one side.
白佛言。云何。瞿曇。為自作自覺耶。	He said to the Buddha: "What do you say, Gotama? Is the one who acts the one who

[54] Saṃyutta-nikāya 12. 46 Aññataraṃ (vol. ii, p. 75). Tripāṭhī, Sūtra 18. CSA vol. 2, pp. 40-41; FSA vol. 1, pp. 574-575.
[55] P. aññatara, "another" or "a certain".
[56] A priest in Brahmanism.

experiences [the result]?"

佛告婆羅門。我說此是無記。自作自覺。此是無記。

The Buddha said to that brahmin: "I say that this is not to be declared.[57] That the one who acts is the one who experiences [the result] is not to be declared."

云何。瞿曇。他作他覺耶。

[The brahmin asked]: "What do you say, Gotama? Is it that one acts and another experiences [the result]?"

佛告婆羅門。他作他覺。此是無記。

The Buddha said: "That one acts and another experiences [the result], this too is not to be declared."

婆羅門白佛。云何。我問自作自覺。說言無記。他作他覺。說言無記。此義云何。

The brahmin said to the Buddha: "What does this mean? When I ask, is the one who acts the one who experiences [the result], you say that that is not to be declared; and when I ask is

[57] Skt. avyākṛta, P. avyākata.

it that one acts and another experiences [the result], you also say that that is not to be declared. What is the meaning of this?"

佛告婆羅門。自作自覺則墮常見。他作他覺則墮斷見。

The Buddha said: "To declare that the one who acts is the one who experiences [the result] is to fall into the eternalist view.[58] To declare that one acts and another experiences [the result] is to fall into the annihilationist view.[59]

義說. 法說。離此二邊。處於中道而說法。

"Teaching the essence, teaching the dharma, I avoid these two extremes. Keeping to the Middle Way, I teach the dharma,

所謂此有故彼有。此起故彼起。緣無明行。乃至純大苦聚集。無明滅則行滅。乃至純大苦聚滅。

namely: When this is, that is; this arising, that arises. Conditioned by ignorance, activities arise, and so on ..., and thus is the origin of

58 Skt. śāśvata-dṛṣṭi, P. sassata-diṭṭhi.
59 Skt. uccheda-dṛṣṭi, P. uccheda-diṭṭhi.

this whole mass of suffering. Ignorance ceasing, activities ceases, and so on ..., and thus is the ceasing of this whole mass of suffering."

佛說此經已。彼婆羅門歡喜隨喜。從座起去。

When the Buddha had taught this discourse, the brahmin was delighted, and, rising from his seat, he departed.

5. 大空法經 The great discourse on the emptiness of dharmas

T 2, pp. 84c-85a, sūtra No. 297.[60]

如是我聞。	Thus have I heard.
一時。佛住拘留搜調牛聚落。	At one time, the Buddha was staying in the cow-herding community of the Kurus.
爾時。世尊告諸比丘。我當為汝等說法。初．中．後善。善義善味。純一清淨。梵行清白。所謂大空法經。	At that time, the Buddha said to the monks: "I will teach you the dharma, which is good in its beginning, middle, and end; which is of good meaning and good flavour, entirely pure, pure for the noble life, namely: the great discourse[61] on the emptiness of dharmas.[62]

[60] Saṃyutta-nikāya 12. 35-36 Avijjāpaccayā (vol. ii, pp. 60-63). Skt. version, Tripāṭhī, Sūtra 15 and Lamotte (1973). CSA vol. 2, pp. 36-37; FSA vol. 1, pp. 570-572.
[61] sūtra.
[62]大空法經.

諦聽。善思。當為汝說。

"Listen attentively, consider well, and I will teach you.

云何為大空法經。所謂此有故彼有。此起故彼起。謂緣無明行。緣行識。乃至純大苦聚集。

"What is the great discourse on the emptiness of dharmas? It is this: Because this exists, that exists; because this arises, that arises. That is to say: Conditioned by ignorance, activities arise; because of activities, consciousness arises, and so on ..., and thus arises this whole mass of suffering.

緣生老死者。若有問言。彼誰老死。老死屬誰。

"Regarding [the statement] conditioned by birth, aging-and-death arises, someone may ask: Who is it that ages-and-dies? To whom does aging-and-death belong?

彼則答言。我即老死。今老死屬我。老死是我。

"And he may answer: It is the self that ages-and-dies. Aging-and-death belongs to the self; aging-and-death is the self.

所言。命即是身。或言。命異身異。此則一義。而說有種種。

"To say that soul[63] is the same thing as body,[64] or to say that soul is one thing and body another, these have the same meaning, though they are expressed differently.

若見言。命即是身。彼梵行者所無有。若復見言。命異身異。梵行者所無有。

"For one who has the view which says that soul is the same thing as body, there is no point in the noble life. And for one who has the other view which says that soul is one thing and body another, there is also no point in the noble life.

於此二邊。心所不隨。正向中道。

"Following neither of these two extremes, the mind should move rightly toward the Middle Way.

賢聖出世。如實不顛倒正見。

"The noble ones, transcending the world, free of distortion, have right view, seeing the true nature of phenomena,

---

[63] Skt. P. jīva.

[64] Skt. śarīra, P. sarīra.

謂緣生老死。如是生．有．取．愛受．觸．六入處．名色．識．行。緣無明故有行。	namely: Conditioned by birth is aging-and-death, and similarly conditioned are birth, becoming, attachment, craving, feeling, contact, the six sense-spheres, name and form, consciousness, and activities. Conditioned by ignorance, activities arise.
若復問言。誰是行。行屬誰。	"And if someone asks: Who are the activities? To whom do the activities belong?
彼則答言。行則是我。行是我所。	"He may answer: The activities are the self, activities belong to the self.
彼如是。命即是身。或言。命異身異。	"Thus for him, soul is the same thing as body; or he may say that soul is one thing and body another.
彼見命即是身者。梵行者無有。或言命異身異者。梵行者亦無有。	"For one who views soul and body as the same thing, there is no point in the noble life; and for one who says soul is one thing and body another, there is also no point in the noble life.

此二邊。正向中道。

"Avoiding these two extremes, move rightly toward the Middle Way.

賢聖出世。如實不顛倒正見所知。所謂緣無明行。

"The noble ones, transcending the world, free of distortion, have right view, seeing the true nature of things, namely: Conditioned by ignorance are activities.

諸比丘。若無明離欲而生明。彼誰老死。老死屬誰者。老死則斷。則知斷其根本。如截多羅樹頭。於未來世成不生法。

"Monks! As to who ages-and-dies, and to whom aging-and-death belongs, when ignorance fades away, and knowledge arises, aging and death are cut off, and one knows they have been cut off at the root, like the cut off stump of a palm tree, never to arise again in the future.

若比丘無明離欲而生明。彼誰生。生屬誰。乃至誰是行。行屬誰者。行則斷。則知斷其根本。如截多羅樹頭。於未來世成不生法。

"As to who is born, and to whom birth belongs, and so on ...; and as to who are the activities, and to whom the activities belong, when ignorance fades away and knowledge arises in a monk, activities are cut off,

and one knows they have been cut off at the root, like the cut off stump of a palm tree, never to arise again in the future.

若比丘無明離欲而生明。彼無明滅則行滅。乃至純大苦聚滅。	"When ignorance fades away and knowledge arises in a monk, in him ignorance ceases, and thus activities cease, and so on ..., and this whole mass of suffering ceases.
是名大空法經。	"This is called 'the great discourse on the emptiness of dharmas'."
佛說此經已。諸比丘聞佛所說。歡喜奉行。	When the Buddha had taught this discourse, all the monks, hearing what the Buddha had said, were delighted, and put it into practice.

6. 施設正見 Establishing right view

T 2, pp. 85c-86a, sūtra No. 301.[65]

如是我聞。	Thus have I heard:
一時。佛住那梨聚落深林中待賓舍。	At one time, the Buddha was staying at the reception hall in the forest of Ñātika.[66]
爾時。尊者跚陀迦旃延詣佛所。稽首佛足。退住一面。	Then, the venerable Katyāyana[67] came to where the Buddha was, saluted him by prostrating with his head to the ground and touching the feet of the Buddha, and sat down at one side.
白佛言。世尊。如世尊說正見。云何正見。云何世尊施設正見。	He then asked the Buddha: "World Honoured One, you speak of right view. What is right view? How, World Honoured One, does one

[65] Saṃyutta-nikāya 12. 15 Kaccāyanagotta (vol. ii, p. 16). Skt. version, Tripāṭhī, Sūtra 19. CSA vol. 2, pp. 41-42; FSA vol. 1, pp. 576-577.

[66] Pali.

[67] P. Kaccāyana = 跚陀迦旃延

	establish right view?"
佛告𨅔陀迦旃延。世間有二種依。若有・若無。	The Buddha said to Katyāyana: "There are two [bases] to which people in the world are attached, to which they adhere: existence and non-existence.
爲取所觸。取所觸故。或依有・或依無。	"Because of their attachment and adherence, they are based on either existence or non-existence.
若無此取者。心境繫著使不取．不住．不計我苦生而生。苦滅而滅。	"In one who has no such attachment, bondage to the mental realm, there is no attachment to self, no dwelling in or setting store by self. Then, when suffering arises, it arises; and when it ceases, it ceases.
於彼不疑・不惑。不由於他而自知。是名正見。是名如來所施設正見。	"If one does not doubt this, is not perplexed by it, if one knows it in oneself and not from others, this is

called right view,[68] right view as established by the Tathāgata (the Buddha).

所以者何。世間集如實正知見。若世間無者不有。

"Why is this? One who rightly sees and knows, as it really is, the arising of the world, does not hold to the non-existence[69] of the world.

世間滅如實正知見。若世間有者無有。

"One who rightly sees and knows, as it really is, the cessation (passing away) of the world, does not hold to the existence[70] of the world.

是名離於二邊說於中道。

"That is called avoiding the two extremes, and teaching the middle way,

所謂此有故彼有。此起故彼起。謂緣無明行。乃至純大苦聚集。無明滅故行滅。乃至純大苦聚滅。

namely: Because this exists, that exists; because this arises, that arises. That is, conditioned by ignorance, activities arise, and so on ..., and thus this

[68] P. sammā diṭṭhi.
[69] Annihilationist view.
[70] Eternalist view.

whole mass of suffering arises. When ignorance ceases, activities cease, and so on ..., and thus this whole mass of suffering ceases."

佛說此經已。尊者跋陀迦旃延 聞佛所說。不起諸漏。心得解脫。成阿羅漢。

When the Buddha had taught this discourse, the venerable Katyāyana, having heard what the Buddha had said, became freed of all influences,[71] attained liberation of mind, and became an arahant.

---

[71] Skt. āsrava, P. āsava.

7. 因緣法[72] 及緣生法 The dharma of arising by causal condition and the dharmas arisen by causal condition

T 2, p. 84b, sūtra No. 296.[73]

如是我聞。

Thus have I heard.

一時。佛住王舍城迦蘭陀竹園。爾時。世尊告諸比丘。我今當說因緣法及緣生法。云何爲因緣法。

At one time, the Buddha was staying in Kalandaka's bamboo-grove,[74] at Rājagṛha.[75] Then, the World-Honoured One said to the monks: "Now, I will teach the dharma[76] of arising by causal condition and the dharmas arisen by causal condition.[77] What is the dharma of arising by causal condition?

---

[72] = 緣起法.

[73] Saṃyutta-nikāya 12. 20 Paccayo (vol. ii, p. 25). Tripāṭhī, Sūtra 14. CSA vol. 2, pp. 34-35; FSA vol. 1, pp. 568-570.

[74] P. veḷuvana.

[75] P. Rājagaha.

[76] The nature of phenomena.

[77] 因緣法 Skt. pratītyasamutpādaḥ, P. paṭiccasamuppāda (= 緣起法). 緣生法 Skt. pratītyasamutpannā dharmāḥ, P. paṭiccasamuppannā dhammā. Choong (2000), pp. 150-151.

謂此有故彼有。謂緣無明行。緣行識。乃至如是如是純大苦聚集。	"It is [this]: Because this exists, that exists; namely: conditioned by ignorance are the activities; conditioned by the activities is consciousness, and so on ..., and thus this whole mass of suffering arises.
云何緣生法。	"What are the dharmas arisen by causal condition?
謂無明・行。若佛出世。若未出世。此法常住。法住法界。	"This is to say: Ignorance, activities ... . Whether or not a Buddha arises in the world, this is the unchangeable nature of dharma,[78] the status of dharma,[79] the element of dharma.[80]
彼如來自所覺知。成等正覺。為人演說。開示顯發。謂緣無明有行。乃至	"The Tathāgata, who has by himself become enlightened with regard to

[78] Skt. dharma-niyāmatā, P. dhamma-niyāmatā.
[79] Skt. dharma-sthitatā, P. dhammaṭṭhitatā.
[80] Skt. dharma-dhātu. P. dhamma-dhātu. Idappaccayatā in SN. 12. 20. Paccayo. Cf. Choong (2000), p. 153.

緣生有老死。

this, who has attained the highest enlightenment, declares it for humankind, teaches it, reveals it, namely: Conditioned by ignorance are activities, and so on ..., conditioned by birth are aging and death.

若佛出世。若未出世。此法常住。法住法界。彼如來自覺知。成等正覺。為人演說。開示顯發。謂緣生故。有老．病．死．憂．悲．惱．苦。

"Whether a Buddha arises in the world, or not, this is the unchangeable nature of dharma, the status of dharma, the element of dharma. The Tathāgata, who has by himself become enlightened of this, who has attained the highest enlightenment, declares it for humankind, teaches it, reveals it, namely: Conditioned by birth, there exist aging-sickness-death-sorrow-affliction-suffering.

此等諸法。法住．法空．法如．法爾。法不離如。

"All these dharmas are the status of dharma, the standing of dharma,[81] the

[81] 法定 The unchangeable nature of dharma. Original Taishō text has 法空, but according to CSA, it should be 法定 (vol.2, p. 36).

法不異如。審諦真實．不顛倒。如是隨順緣起。是名緣生法。謂無明．行．識．名色．六入處．觸．受．愛．取．有．生．老．病．死．憂．悲．惱．苦。是名緣生法。

suchness of dharma;[82] the dharma neither departs from things-as-they-are, nor differs from things-as-they-are; it is the truth, reality, without distortion. Such conformity to conditioned genesis[83] is called the dharmas arisen by causal condition, namely: Ignorance, activities, consciousness, name-and-form, the six sense-spheres, contact, feeling, craving, attachment, becoming, birth, aging-sickness-death-sorrow-affliction-suffering. This is called the dharmas arisen by causal condition.

多聞聖弟子於此因緣法．緣生法正知善見。

"The noble disciple who has learned much attains right wisdom regarding both the dharma of arising by causal condition and the dharmas arisen by causal condition, and truly sees.

---

82 The nature of phenomena as they really are.

83 隨順緣起, Skt. pratītyasamutpādānulomatā, Choong (2000), p. 154.

不求前際。言。我過去世若有．若無。我過去世何等類。我過去世何如。

"He will not look backwards into time past, saying: 'Did I exist in the past, or did I not? Of what caste was I in the past? How was I in the past?'

不求後際。我於當來世爲有·為無。云何類。何如。

"Nor he will look fowards to the coming time: 'Shall I exist in the future, or shall I not? Of what caste shall I be? How shall I be?'

內不猶豫。此是何等。云何有此為前。誰終當云何之。此衆生從何來。於此沒當何之。

"Nor does he inwardly hesitate [thinking]: 'What is this? Why does it exist? Who was this in the past? What will it become in the end? Where do all these beings come from? What will they become when they die?'

若沙門·婆羅門起凡俗見所繫。謂說我見所繫．說衆生見所繫．說壽命見所繫．忌諱吉慶見所繫。爾時悉斷．悉知。斷其根

"If in a recluse[84] or a brahmin there has arisen bondage to worldly view, namely bondage to self view, to the view that there are beings, views about

[84] Skt. śramaṇa, P.samaṇa.

本。如截多羅樹頭。於未來世。成不生法。

long life, views about evil and auspicious omens, then these are completely cut off, completely known. They are cut off at the root, like the cut off stump of a palm tree, never to arise again in the future.

是名多聞聖弟子於因緣法．緣生法如實正知。善見．善覺．善修．善入。

"This is to say, the noble disciple who has learned much attains right wisdom regarding both the dharma of arising by causal condition and the dharmas arisen by causal condition. He truly sees them, he is truly enlightened, truly cultivated, [and] has truly penetrated the nature of phenomena as they really are."

佛說此經已。諸比丘聞佛所說。歡喜奉行。

When the Buddha had taught this discourse, the monks, having heard what the Buddha had said, were delighted, and put it into practice.

8. 緣起法 The dharma of conditioned arising

T 2, p. 85b, sūtra No. 299.[85]

如是我聞。

Thus have I heard.

一時。佛住拘留搜調牛聚落。時。有異比丘來詣佛所。稽首禮足。退坐一面。

At one time, the Buddha was staying in the cow-tending community of the Kurus. At that time, a certain monk came to where the Buddha was, prostrated with his head and touched the feet of the Buddha, stepped back, and sat down at one side.

白佛言。世尊。謂緣起法爲世尊作。爲餘人作耶。

He said to the Buddha: "World-Honoured One, that which is called the dharma of conditioned arising, was it made by the World-Honoured One, or by others?"

佛告比丘。緣起法者。非我所作。亦非餘人作。然

The Buddha said to the monk: "Conditioned arising was neither made by me,

[85] No Pali counterpart. Tripāṭhī, Sūtra 17. CSA vol. 2, p. 40; FSA vol. 1, p. 574.

彼如來出世及未出世。法界常住。彼如來自覺此法。成等正覺。為諸眾生分別演說。開發顯示。

nor made by others. Whether a Tathāgata arises in the world, or not, this element of dharma remains unchanging. The Tathāgata, who has by himself become enlightened regarding this dharma, who has attained the highest enlightenment, he distinguishes it for all living beings, he declares it, develops it, reveals it,

所謂此有故彼有。此起故彼起。謂緣無明行。乃至純大苦聚集。無明滅故行滅。乃至純大苦聚滅。

namely: Because this exists, that exists; because this arises, that arises; that is to say: Conditioned by ignorance are activities, and so on ..., and thus arises this whole mass of suffering. When ignorance ceases, activities cease, and so on ..., and thus ceases this whole mass of suffering."

佛說此經已。時。彼比丘聞佛所說。歡喜奉行。

When the Buddha had taught this discourse, that monk, having heard what the Buddha had said, was delighted, and put it into practice.

9. 古仙人道 The ancient way of the noble ones

T 2, pp. 80b-81a, sūtra No. 287.[86]

如是我聞。	Thus have I heard.
一時。佛住舍衛國祇樹給孤獨園。	At one time, the Buddha was staying at Jetavana, Anāthapiṇḍika's park at Śrāvastī.
爾時。世尊告諸比丘。我憶宿命未成正覺時。獨一靜處。專精禪思。作是念。	Then, the World-Honoured One said to the monks: "I recollect that once, before I had attained the highest enlightenment, when alone in a quiet place, concentrated energetically on meditation, I had this thought:
何法有故老死有。何法緣故老死有。	"Because of the existence of what dharma (nature of phenomena), do aging-and-death come to be? Conditioned by what dharma, do aging-and-

[86] Saṃyutta-nikāya 12. 65 Nagaraṃ (vol. ii, p. 104). Tripāṭhī Sūtra 5. CSA vol. 2, pp. 11-12; FSA vol. 1, pp. 546-549. See also Choong (2000), pp. 176-177.

death come to be?

即正思惟。生如實無間等。

"Then, rightly thinking, I came to grasp[87] the nature of phenomena as they really are, directly:

生有故老死有。生緣故老死有。如是有．取．愛．受．觸．六入處．名色。

"Because birth exists, aging-and-death exist; conditioned by birth, aging-and-death exist; and similarly for becoming, attachment, craving, feeling, contact, the six sense-spheres, name-and-material form.

何法有故名色有。何法緣故名色有。

"Because of the existence of what dharma do name-and-material form exist? Conditioned by what dharma do name-and-material form come to be?

即正思惟。如實無間等生。

"Then, rightly thinking, I came to grasp the nature of phenomena as they really are, directly:

[87] 無間等, P. abhisamaya.

識有故名色有。識緣故有名色有。	"Because consciousness exists, name-and-material form exist; conditioned by consciousness, name-and-material form come to be.
我作是思惟時。齊識而還不能過彼。	"I then had this thought: As far as consciousness it turns back, unable to go beyond it.[88]
謂緣識名色。緣名色六入處。	"That is to say: Conditioned by consciousness are name-and-material form; conditioned by name-and-material form are the six sense-spheres;
緣六入處觸。緣觸受。	conditioned by the six sense-spheres is contact; conditioned by contact is feeling;
緣受愛。緣愛取。	conditioned by feeling is craving; conditioned by craving is attachment;

[88] Cf. Choong (2000), pp. 176-177.

緣取有。緣有生。

conditioned by attachment is becoming; conditioned by becoming is birth;

緣生老．病．死．憂．悲．惱．苦。如是如是純大苦聚集。

conditioned by birth is aging-sickness-and-death, along with depression, sorrow, affliction, and suffering. Thus arises this whole mass of suffering.

我時作是念。何法無故則老死無。何法滅故老死滅。

"Then I thought: Because of the non-existence of what dharma, do aging-and-death not come to be? Because of the ceasing of what dharma, do aging-and-death cease?

即正思惟。生如實無間等。

"Then, rightly thinking, I came to grasp the nature of phenomena as they really are, directly:

生無故老死無。生滅故老死滅。如是生．有．取．愛．受．觸．六入處．名色．識·行廣說。

"When birth does not exist, aging-and-death do not exist; when birth ceases, aging-and-death cease. And similarly it is to be said of birth, becoming, attachment, craving, feeling, contact, the six

sense-spheres, name-and-material form, consciousness, the activities.

我復作是思惟。何法無故行無。何法滅故行滅。

"Again I thought thus: Because of the non-existence of what dharma, do activities not come to be? Because of the ceasing of what dharma, do activities cease?

即正思惟如實無間等。

"Then, rightly thinking, I came to grasp the nature of phenomena as they really are, directly:

無明無故行無。無明滅故行滅。

"When ignorance does not exist, activities do not exist; when ignorance ceases, activities cease;

行滅故識滅。識滅故名色滅。

when activities cease, consciousness ceases; when consciousness ceases, name-and-material form ceases;

名色滅故六入處滅。六入處滅故觸滅。

when name-and-material form ceases, the six sense-spheres cease; when the six

	sense-spheres cease, contact ceases;
觸滅故受滅。受滅故愛滅。	when contact ceases, feeling ceases; when feeling ceases, craving ceases;
愛滅故取滅。取滅故有滅。	when craving ceases, attachment ceases; when attachment ceases, becoming ceases;
有滅故生滅。生滅故老．病．死．憂．悲．惱．苦滅。如是如是純大苦聚滅。	when becoming ceases, birth ceases; when birth ceases, aging-sickness-and-death ceases, along with depression, sorrow, affliction, and suffering; and thus ceases this whole mass of suffering.
我時作是念。我得古仙人道．古仙人逕．古仙人道跡。古仙人從此跡去。我今隨去。	"Then I thought thus: I have attained to the ancient way of the noble ones, the path of the noble ones, the ancient way trodden by the noble ones, along which passed the noble ones of ancient times, and which I am now following.

譬如有人遊於曠野。披荒覓路。忽遇故道古人行處。	"It is just as if a man travelling through the forest, through the wild woods, were suddenly to come upon an ancient way, a path where men had walked in ancient times.
彼則隨行。漸漸前進。見故城邑．古王宮殿・園觀浴池・林木清淨。彼作是念。	"He goes along it, and slowly moving forwards, sees an ancient city, and an ancient king's palace, and gardens, and pools, and pleasant groves, and he thinks:
我今當往白王令知。即往白王。大王當知。	"I should go and tell the king of this. And then he goes and tells the king: Your Majesty should know this.
我遊曠野。披荒求路。忽見故道古人行處。我即隨行。我隨行已。見故城邑．故王宮殿．園觀浴池．林流清淨。	"As I was travelling through the forest through the wild woods, I suddenly came upon an ancient way, a path where men walked in ancient times; then I went along it, and when I had gone along it, I saw an ancient city, and an ancient king's palace, and gardens,

and pools, and pleasant groves and streams.

大王可往居止其中。王即往彼。止住其中。豐樂安隱。人民熾盛。

"Your Majesty could go and live in that city. Then, the king goes there, and lives there, and the city becomes prosperous and flourishing, and teeming with people.

今我如是。得古仙人道．古仙人逕．古仙人跡。古仙人去處。我得隨去。

"In the same way, I had now arrived at the ancient way of the noble ones, the ancient path of the noble ones, the ancient way trodden by the noble ones, along which passed the noble ones of ancient times, and which I should now follow,

謂八聖道。正見．正志．正語．正業．正命．正方便．正念．正定。

namely this Noble Eightfold Path: right view, right aim, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right skilful means (effort), right mindfulness, right concentration.

我從彼道見老病死・老病死集・老病死滅．老病死滅道跡。	"I have gone along this path and seen aging-sickness-and-death, the origin of aging-sickness-and-death, the ceasing of aging-sickness-and-death, the path leading to the ceasing of aging-sickness-and-death.
見生・有・取・愛・受・觸・六入處．名色．識．行．行集．行滅．行滅道跡。	"I have seen birth ..., becoming ..., attachment ..., craving ..., feeling ..., contact ..., the six sense-spheres ..., name-and-material form ..., consciousness ..., activities, the origin of activities, the ceasing of activities, the path leading to the ceasing of activities.
我於此法自知自覺。成等正覺。	"I have by myself become enlightened regarding this dharma and have attained the highest enlightenment.
爲比丘・比丘尼・優婆	"I have taught and declared to monks, nuns,[89] laymen,[90]

[89] Skt. bhikṣuṇī, P. bhikkhuni.

塞．優婆夷。及餘外道沙門·婆羅門·在家·出家。彼諸四眾聞法正向．信樂。知法善。梵行增廣。多所饒益。開示顯發。

laywomen,[91] to followers of other sects, to recluses and brahmins, to householders, and to those who have left the household life, so that all these four groups may hear the dharma, find the right direction, gain faith and happiness, know the goodness of the dharma, increase in the noble life, and derive greater benefit."

佛說此經已。諸比丘聞佛所說。歡喜奉行。

When the Buddha had taught this discourse, the monks, having heard what the Buddha had said, were delighted, and put it into practice.

---

[90] P. upāsaka.
[91] P. upāsikā.

10. 第一義空經 The discourse on emptiness in its ultimate meaning

T 2, p. 92c, sūtra No. 335[92] (cf. sūtra No. 297).

如是我聞。	Thus have I heard.
一時。佛住拘留搜調牛聚落。	At one time, the Buddha was staying in a village of the cow-herding Kuru people.
爾時。世尊告諸比丘。我今當爲汝等說法。初.中.後善。善義善味。純一滿淨。梵行清白。所謂第一義空經。諦聽。善思。當為汝說。	At that time, the Buddha said to the monks: "I will teach you dharma which is good in its beginning, middle, and end, which is of good meaning and good flavour, entirely pure, pure for the noble life, namely: The discourse on emptiness in its ultimate meaning.[93] Listen attentively, consider well, and I will teach you.

[92] No Pali counterpart. For Skt. version, see Lamotte (1973). CSA vol. 1, p. 414; FSA vol. 1, pp. 532-533.

[93] Skt. paramārtha-śūnyatā-sūtra. Choong (1999), p. 38; (2000), pp. 95-96.

云何爲第一義空經。

"What is the discourse on emptiness in its ultimate meaning?

諸比丘。眼生時無有來處。滅時無有去處。如是眼不實而生。生已盡滅。有業報而無作者。

"Monks, when the eye arises, there is no place from which it comes; when it ceases, there is no place to which it goes. Thus, the eye, being not real, arises; having arisen it ceases completely. It is a result of [previous] action[94] but there is no doer.[95]

此陰滅已。異陰相續。除俗數法。耳・鼻・舌・身・意亦如是說。除俗數法。

"When these aggregates[96] cease, other aggregates continue, with the exception of this transient dharma.[97] It is the same with the ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind. They are exceptions to the transient dharma.

---

[94] Skt. Karma-vipāka, P. kamma-vipāka

[95] Skt. akartṛka (= not-self).

[96] 陰 = 蘊, Skt. Skandha, P. Khandha.

[97] Or conventional dharma, 俗數法, Skt. dharmasaṃketa, a characteristically Sarvāstivādin term, signifying much the same as "compounded thing".

俗數法者。謂此有故彼有。此起故彼起。如無明緣行。行緣識。廣說乃至純大苦聚集起。	"The meaning of transient dharma is: Because this exists, that exists; because this arises, that arises, thus: Conditioned by ignorance are activities; conditioned by activities is consciousness, and so on ... and thus arises this whole mass of suffering.
又復。此無故彼無。此滅故彼滅。無明滅故行滅。行滅故識滅。如是廣說。乃至純大苦聚滅。	"And again, when this does not exist, that does not exist; when this ceases, that ceases. When ignorance ceases, activities cease; when activities cease, consciousness ceases, and so on ..., and thus ceases this whole mass of suffering.
比丘。是名第一義空法經。	"Monks, this is called the discourse on emptiness in its ultimate meaning."
佛說此經已。諸比丘聞佛所說。歡喜奉行。	When the Buddha had taught this discourse, the monks, having heard what the Buddha had said, were delighted and put it into practice.

11. 空諸行 All empty compounded things

T 2, pp. 72b-73a, sūtra No. 273.[98]

如是我聞。一時。佛住舍衛國祇樹給孤獨園。...	Thus have I heard. At one time the Buddha was staying at Jetavana, Anāthapiṇḍika's park at Śrāvastī. ...
佛告比丘。...比丘。譬如兩手和合相對作聲。如是緣眼．色。生眼識。三事和合觸。觸俱生受．想．思。	The Buddha said to the monks: "... Monks, just as two hands coming together produce sound, so, conditioned by eye and visible forms arises eye consciousness, and these three things together are contact. From contact arise feeling, perception, and volition.
此等諸法非我・非常。是無常之我。非恒。非安隱．變易之我。所以者何。	"All these phenomena are not-self, impermanent; they are without a permanent self, not eternal, not stable, changing. Why is this so?

[98] No Pali counterpart. CSA vol. 1, pp. 353-354; FSA vol. 1, pp. 457-459. This discourse was selected from the Chinese for translation.

比丘。謂生．老．死．沒．受生之法。	"Monks, these have the nature of birth, ageing, death, ceasing, and rebirth.
比丘。諸行如幻．如炎。剎那時頃盡朽。不實來實去。	"Monks, all compounded things[99] are as an illusion, a flame, ceasing in an instant; being not real they come (arise) and go (cease).
是故。比丘。於空諸行當知．當喜．當念。	"Therefore, monks, with regard to all empty compounded things[100] you should know, rejoice in, and be mindful of (awake to) this:
空諸行常．恒．住．不變易法空。無我．我所。...	"All empty compounded things are empty of [any] permanent, eternal, lasting, unchanging nature; [they are] empty of self and of belonging to self". ...
如眼．耳．鼻．舌．身．意法因緣生意識。三事和合觸。觸俱生受．想．	"So also for the ear, nose, tongue, body, ... conditioned by mind and its mind-object arises mental

[99] 行, Skt. saṃskārāḥ, P. saṃkhārā.
[100] 空諸行.

思。此諸法無我．無常。乃至空我．我所。. . .

consciousness, and these three together are contact. From contact arise feeling, perception, and volition. All these dharmas (phenomena) are not self, impermanent, and empty of self or of belonging to self. ...

12. 非有非無 Neither existence (remainder) nor non-existence (non- remainder)

T 2, pp. 59c-60a, sūtra No. 249.[101]

如是我聞。	Thus have I heard.
一時。佛住舍衛國祇樹給孤獨園。	At one time the Buddha was staying at Jetavana, Anāthapiṇḍika's park at Śrāvastī.
爾時。尊者阿難詣尊者舍利弗所。語尊者舍利弗。欲有所問。寧有閑暇為解說不。	Then the venerable Ānanda went to where the venerable Śāriputra was, and said to the venerable Śāriputra: "I have a question I wish to ask you, do you have time to explain?"
舍利弗言。隨仁所問。知者當答。	Śāriputra said: "Ask as you wish. If I know, I will answer."
尊者阿難問尊者舍利弗。六觸入處盡。離欲．滅．	The venerable Ānanda asked Śāriputra: "After the

[101] Aṅguttara-nikāya 4 Catukka-nipāta, 173 Paṭisambhidā, 174 Koṭṭhika (vol. ii, pp. 160-161). CSA vol. pp. 276-277; FSA vol. 1, p. 365.

息沒已。更有餘不。

extinction of the six sense-spheres of contact, and the fading away of desire, after cessation, after ending, is there any remainder?

尊者舍利弗語阿難言。莫作此問。六觸入處盡。離欲．滅．息沒已。更有餘不。

The venerable Śāriputra said to Ānanda: "Do not ask the question, 'After the extinction of the six sense-spheres of contact, and the fading away of desire, after cessation, after ending, is there any remainder?'"

阿難又問尊者舍利弗。六觸入處盡。離欲．滅．息沒已。無有餘耶。

Then Ānanda asked the venerable Śāriputra: "After the extinction of the six sense-spheres of contact, and the fading away of desire, after cessation, after ending, is there no remainder?"

尊者舍利弗答阿難言。亦復不應作如是問。六觸入處盡。離欲．滅．息沒已。無有餘耶。

The venerable Śāriputra said to Ānanda: "Also do not ask the question, 'After the extinction of the six sense-spheres of contact, and the fading away of desire, after cessation, after ending, is there no

remainder?'"

阿難復問尊者舍利弗。六觸入處盡。離欲．滅．息沒已。有餘無餘．非有餘非無餘耶。

Then Ānanda asked the venerable Śāriputra: "After the extinction of the six sense-spheres of contact, and the fading away of desire, after cessation, after ending, is there both remainder and no remainder? Or is there neither remainder nor no remainder?"

尊者舍利弗答阿難言。此亦不應作如此問。六觸入處盡。離欲．滅．息沒已。有餘無餘．非有餘非無餘耶。

The venerable Śāriputra said to Ānanda: "Also do not ask the question, 'After the extinction of the six sense-spheres of contact, and the fading away of desire, after cessation, after ending, is there both remainder and no remainder? Or is there neither remainder nor no remainder?'"

尊者阿難又問舍利弗。如尊者所說。六觸入處盡。離欲．滅．息沒已。有亦不應說。無亦不應說。有

Then the venerable Ānanda asked Śāriputra: "According to what you say, after the extinction of the six sense-spheres of

無亦不應說。非有非無亦不應說。此語有何義。	contact, and the fading away of desire, after cessation, after ending, one cannot say there is existence (remainder) and one cannot say there is annihilation (no remainder), and one cannot say there is both existence and annihilation, and also one cannot say there is neither existence nor annihilation. What is the meaning of this?"
尊者舍利弗語尊者阿難。六觸入處盡。離欲．滅．息沒已。有餘耶。此則虛言。	The venerable Śāriputra said to the venerable Ānanda: "To ask 'After the extinction of the six sense-spheres of contact, and the fading away of desire, after cessation, after ending, is there any remainder?' that is meaningless talk.
無餘耶。此則虛言。	"To ask 'Is there no remainder?' that is meaningless talk.
有餘無餘耶。此則虛言。	"To ask 'Is there both remainder and no remainder?' that is

meaningless talk.

非有餘非無餘耶。此則虛言。

"To ask 'Is there neither remainder nor no remainder?' that is meaningless talk.

若言六觸入處盡。離欲.滅.息沒已。離諸虛僞。得般涅槃。此則佛說。

"But if one says that after the extinction of the six sense-spheres of contact, and the fading away of desire, after cessation, after ending, there is fading away of all meaningless argument[102] and the attaining of nirvāṇa, then this is the teaching of the Buddha."

時。二正士展轉隨喜。各還本處。

Then the two noble ones were delighted with each other, and each returned to his place.

[102] Skt. prapañca, P. papañca.

13. 世間空 Empty world

T 2, p. 56b-c, sūtra No. 232.[103]

如是我聞。	Thus have I heard.
一時。佛住舍衛國祇樹給孤獨園。	At one time the Buddha (bhagavant) was staying at Jetavana, Ānāthapiṇḍika's park at Śrāvastī.
時。有比丘名三彌離提。往詣佛所。稽首佛足。退坐一面。白佛言。	Then, a bhiksu named Samṛddhi came to where the Buddha was, saluted him by prostrating with his head to the ground and touching the feet of the Buddha, and sat down at one side. He then asked the Buddha:
世尊。所謂世間空。云何名為世間空。	"It is said 'the world is empty',[104] but in what regard is it said that the world is empty?"

[103] Saṃyutta-nikāya 35. 85 Suñña (vol. iv, p. 54). For Skt. version, see Lamotte (1973). Choong (1999), pp. 14, 89-91; (2000), pp. 93-94.
[104] Skt. śūnyo loko, P. suñño loko.

佛告三彌離提。眼空。常．恒．不變易法空。我所空。	The Buddha said to Samṛddhi: "Eye is empty,[105] empty of eternal and unchanging nature,[106] empty of anything belonging to self.[107]
所以者何。此性自爾。	"Why is this so? This is nature as it is.[108]
若色・眼識・眼觸・眼觸因緣生受。若苦・若樂．不苦不樂。彼亦空。常．恒．不變易法空。我所空。	"Material forms, visual consciousness, visual contact, the feelings unpleasant or pleasant or neither-unpleasant-nor-pleasant that arise conditioned by visual contact are empty, empty of eternal and unchanging nature, empty of anything belonging to self.
所以者何。此性自爾。	"Why is this so? This is nature as it is.

[105] 眼空. Skt. cakṣuḥ śūnyam.

[106] 常恒不變易法空. Skt. śāśvatenāvipariṇāmadharmeṇa śūnyam.

[107] 我所空. Skt. ātmīyena śūnyam.

[108] 此性自爾. Skt. prakṛtir asyaiṣā.

耳・鼻・舌・身・意亦復如是。	"Ear, nose, tongue, body and mind are also thus.
是名空世間。	"This is called 'empty world'."
佛說此經已。三彌離提比丘聞佛所說。歡喜奉行。	When the Buddha had taught this discourse, bhiksu Samṛddhi, having heard what the Buddha had said, was delighted, and put it into practice.

Appendix 1:

Historical and Textual Background of Buddhism

Buddhism, which originated in ancient India, has contributed greatly to the values of humanism, being concerned with human suffering and liberation from suffering. In order to understand the arising and development of Buddhism, some historical and textual background is necessary. This will be provided under three headings: 1. Cultural background, 2. The life of the Buddha, and 3. Schism in the Saṅgha and the early Buddhist texts.[1]

1. Cultural background

This is in two sections: 1.1. Brahmanism, and 1.2. The Śramaṇas (P. Samaṇas).

1.1. Brahmanism

Brahmanism is a conventional term for the ancient **Vedic religion** before it developed into Hinduism from around 200 BCE.

The tradition of Brahmanism, maintained by priests known as Brahmins/Brahmans (Skt. Brāhmaṇa),

[1] This article was my teaching notes at the University of Queensland and University of New England, Australia.

originated with nomadic tribes (the Aryans) who entered the north-west of the Indian sub-continent around 1500 BCE. That area, located in the region of the Indus River in present-day Pakistan, had been dominated since around 2500 BCE by the Harappan, or Indus Valley civilization, a sophisticated city-based culture.

The Aryans spoke an early form of Sanskrit. Sanskrit (from which Pāli is derived) is one of the oldest members of the Indo-European language family (which includes Greek and Latin). The Aryans seem to have come from central Asia, an area now in eastern Turkey, southern Russia and northern Iran. They were pastoral nomads herding cattle; and they were also hunters and warriors, engaging in warfare over land. The Indus people, in contrast, were mainly farmers and traders, dependent on agriculture and trade based on urban centres.

While the Aryan invaders brought the declining Indus Valley culture to an end, their own religious beliefs were influenced by it, for example adopting the practice of yogic meditation. The development of the Aryan religion centred mainly in Kurukṣetra (the region to the north of present-day Delhi), and extended to the central valley of the Ganges River. This area was called "the Middle Land" (P. Majjhima-janapada, Skt. Madhyadeśa). The main religious texts (regarded as sacred) of the Aryans, which were preserved in an oral tradition, are collectively known as the Vedas, Brāhmaṇas and Upaniṣads.

In what follows, Brahmanism, or the Vedic religion of the Aryans, is dealt with in two divisions: (a) Vedas and Brāhmaṇas, and (b) Upaniṣads.

(a) Vedas and Brāhmaṇas

Veda means "knowledge" or "body of knowledge"; the Vedas are a body of knowledge comprising hymns of the priestly sacrificial ritual. The Vedas are in four collections (saṃhitā) of mantras (spoken formulas or statements): (1) Rig/Ṛg-veda, (2) Yajur-veda, (3) Sāma-veda, and (4) Atharva-veda.

The Rig-veda is the earliest (c. 1500-1200 BCE) of the four Vedas. It and the Yajur-veda and Sāma-veda are collections of ritual hymns; the fourth, Atharva-veda, comprises not only ritual hymns but also magical spells. There exist priestly commentaries on the Vedic sacrificial ritual, texts called Brāhmaṇas (c. 1000-800 BCE). In the Vedic period three fundamental principles of Brahmanism were established:

1. The Vedas as revealed by divine powers or gods (devas)
2. The supremacy of the Brahmins
3. The power of the priestly sacrificial ritual

1. The Vedas as revealed by divine powers or gods (devas):

The traditional hymns of the priestly sacrificial ritual are regarded as revelations by divine powers or gods called devas; this gives them their authority. The early Vedic religion recognised many gods and goddesses (devis), generally reckoned as 33 in number. These gods are deified personifications of forces active in the cosmos, the environment, and human life; they are closely associated with the powers of nature. Later (in the period of

Hinduism) three of these gods become centrally important: Brahmā (the creator), Vishnu/Viṣṇu (the preserver), and Shiva/Śiva (the destroyer).

2. The supremacy of the Brahmins:

This has to do with the caste system. In the revelations of the creator god Brahmā (or Puruṣa) four social classes (Skt. varṇa "colour") are distinguished, which are determined by birth (jāti). The four are:

(1) The sacrificial ritual priests, Brahmins or Brahmans (Brāhmaṇa),
(2) The warrior-rulers, Kṣatriya,
(3) The farmers, artisans, and merchants, Vaishya/Vaiśya, and
(4) The servants, Shudra/Śūdra.

In the Rig-veda it is said that the Brahmins (Brāhmaṇa) were born from the mouth of Puruṣa. (Puruṣa is the cosmic Man or primal Person, the creator of the cosmos, identified as the creator god Brahmā.) The Kṣatriyas were born from Puruṣa's arms, the Vaishyas from his thighs, and the Shudras from his feet. Later (c. 300 BCE) the concept of varṇa (color) linked with jāti (birth) takes on the sense of "occupational group" (jāti).

The first to third of the four castes consisted of Aryans; they were the "twice born" (dvijas). The fourth, the Śūdra, were non-Aryans. These four rigid divisions were seen as willed by the gods. The ritual priests or Brahmins thereby acquired the highest social status.

A fifth group, the untouchables, people outside the caste system, was later added to the fourfold division, probably about 1000 BCE. This group consisted of people who did "unclean" jobs, such as tanning leather and disposing of dead animals. In modern times the great Hindu reformer Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi (1869-1948) named them Harijans "Children of God", but they prefer to call themselves Dalit "the Oppressed". Discrimination based on caste was made illegal in India in 1947.

3. The power of the priestly sacrificial ritual:

The relationship between human beings and gods (devas) is based on the sacrificial ritual. The central ritual is the **fire sacrifice**. The Brahmins sing mantras in praise of a particular god and offer him sacrifices by placing them in the sacrificial fire (the god of the fire is called Agni). In return for this they expect health, wealth, happiness, or immortality in the afterlife with the gods. The sacrificial ritual presupposes identifications between elements of the sacrifice and the cosmos, and is the primary purpose of the religion. The actions and the very existence of gods, human beings, and the world are all believed to be caused by and affected by the sacrificial ritual. Thus, the sacrificial ritual exercises control even over gods. In addition, magical charms and imprecations to satisfy popular beliefs and personal needs are also included in the ritual referred to in the Atharva-veda.

(b) Upaniṣads

In time, the Aryan settlements gradually expanded from west to east, reaching to the region of the central Ganges River, where there was a kingdom called Videha (capital city: Mithilā). The Videhans were not Aryans. As the Aryans colonized and eventually conquered the land, the Brahmins learned from the indigenous people. In making spiritual preparations for performing the sacrifice, the Brahmins learnt yoga: meditation techniques, seclusion, celibacy, and asceticism (tapas, such as fasting and physical torments), practices which derived from the indigenous people. Some Brahmins practiced these in forest retreats, seeing this as a way of performing the sacrifice in internalized form. These forest dwellers made identifications between elements of the sacrifice and elements of the cosmos, and emphasized only the meaning of the ritual sounds (mantras) and actions. They believed in the power and importance of mental ritual performance, rather than of the physical ritual performance. Their teachings are contained in collections called **Āraṇyakas** "Forest Books". In this way, the region of the central Ganges River developed a new form of religious culture. It gave rise, around 750-550 BCE, to a class of teachings called **Upaniṣads**. Of the existing Upaniṣads only two, Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad and Chāndogya Upaniṣad, are certainly pre-Buddhist.

Two fundamentally important philosophical ideas are established in the Upaniṣads:

(1) Saṃsāra based on karma
(2) The identity of ātman and Brahman

Saṃsāra is "the continuous cycle of death and rebirth", and karma is "action". The notion of saṃsāra and karma is that the nature and destiny of all individuals, including Brahmins, whether now or in the future, are determined by those individuals' karmas or deeds. In saṃsāra a person will reincarnate as some form of human or animal according to the quality of that person's karma. This concept of saṃsāra and karma derived from the beliefs of the indigenous people.

Brahman is the soul of the cosmos/universe. It underlies the whole cosmos. Its personified deification is called Brahmā (the creator god). Ātman is the individual soul/self. The Upaniṣads teach that these two permanent entities, Brahman and ātman, are ultimately identical. That is, ātman is identical with Brahman. The realisation that ātman is Brahman may be attained deep within the pure mind (regarded as the true self) by practising yogic meditation. True knowledge of this identity brings liberation from the suffering of saṃsāra. This realisation of ātman-Brahman is considered the highest and only true happiness in life.

The ātman-Brahman idea, combined with belief in saṃsāra and karma, brought into doubt the privilege and supremacy of the Brahmins. The Upaniṣads undermined the power of the priestly sacrificial ritual, and the power of the gods. Thus, the philosophy of ātman-Brahman and karma-saṃsāra challenged the old Vedic religion, and paved the way for the next development, centred on the Śramaṇas, one of whom was Gautama Buddha.

1.2. The Śramaṇas (P. Samaṇas)

The kingdom of Videha came to an end, but around the beginning of the sixth century BCE, a tribal kingdom called Magadha (capital Rājagṛha, today's Rājgir) emerged in a region south of the central Ganges. Numerous tribal kingdoms also became established to the north of the Ganges. These south and north regions of the central Ganges, mixed in the east with non-Aryans but influenced by the Aryan religious culture from the west, developed the culture of the Śramaṇas. This movement rejected the supremacy of the Brahmins and the Vedic tradition. In this period, the intellectual communities linked with urban centres were drawn not from the Brahmins but from the warrior-rulers (Kṣatriya) and the farmers, artisans, and merchants (Vaishya).

The Brahmins, the traditional sacrificial ritual priests, had their own family life, and emphasized blood-lineage. By contrast, the Śramaṇas were recluses, homeless wanderers, living on alms, and dedicated to contemplation, debate and investigation for personal salvation. A Śramaṇa was therefore also called parivrājaka (wanderer), saṃnyāsin (renounced person), bhikṣu (almsman, mendicant), or muni (sage).

The Śramaṇas, who accepted the notion of karma-saṃsāra, rejected the power of the priestly sacrificial ritual of the Vedic tradition. They sought the meaning of life and lasting happiness in true ultimate "liberation" (Skt. mokṣa, mukti, vimukti, P. mokkha, mutti, vimutti) from the suffering of saṃsāra. The Buddha belonged to this Śramaṇa movement. A description and assessment of the other Śramaṇa groups (six main groups) is contained in a

Buddhist text called the Sāmaññaphala-sutta (Skt. Śrāmaṇyaphala-sūtra) (DN 2 = DA 27). Jainism, founded by Mahāvīra (Vardhamāna), was one of them at that time, and still continues today in India. Other Śramaṇa groups died out; but in terms of influence and popular support in Indian culture, Buddhism and Jainism became the two great religions outside the orthodox Brahmanical system.[2]

2. A brief outline of the life of the Buddha

The Buddha is also known as Śākya-muni "the Śākyan sage". His name was Siddhārtha Gautama (P. Siddhattha Gotama). He was born, in the garden Lumbinī located in present-day southern Nepal, as a prince of the republic of the Śākyas (P. Sakka). His father was King Śuddhodana Gautama, and his mother was Queen Māyā. The capital of the republic was Kapilavastu (P. Kapilavatthu). The ancient site of Kapilavastu is now thought to be located either in Nepal at Tilaurakot (near Taulihawa in modern Padaria) or in northern India at Piprahwa (in the district of Bastī, Uttar Pradesh state), both of which are close to Lumbinī. Seven days after giving birth, his mother Māyā died, so the young prince Siddhārtha was brought up by

[2] Note: The four "stages of life" (ashrama/āśrama) as a social duty in Hinduism are developed later (c. 200 BCE, based on Mānava-dharma-Śāstra "The Laws of Manu" of the Dharma Śāstra "Treatises on Dharma"): 1. Brahmacharya, the celibate student stage; 2. Grihasthya, the married householder stage; 3. Vanaprasthya ("forest dwelling"), the retirement state; and 4. Sannyasa, the renounced stage.

his mother's sister, Prajāpatī who was also married to his father. At the age of sixteen Siddhārtha was married to Yaśodharā, and at twenty-nine they had a son named Rāhula.

Siddhārtha was dissatisfied with the regal pomposity and luxurious life, and was obsessed with the various problems of human life. At the age of twenty-nine he secretly left the palace to become a śramaṇa (recluse) and seek ultimate liberation. He spent six years practising yoga meditation and asceticism, but could not attain the knowledge that would bring liberation from the burden of human suffering. He then abandoned those practices, and finally at Bodh Gaya under the Bodhi tree (or Bo tree) attained Enlightenment (bodhi). In his Enlightenment, attained through meditation (Skt. dhyāna, P. jhāna) and insight (Skt. prajñā, P. paññā) into the nature of phenomena (dharmas), he saw their **conditioned arising** (Skt. pratītyasamutpādaḥ, P. paṭiccasamuppāda) and ceasing (Skt. P. nirodha), in accordance with the **four noble truths** (P. cattāri ariyasaccāni) (suffering, its arising, its cessation, and the way to its cessation).

Deciding to teach others what he had attained, he gave his first discourse in the Deer-park (Skt. Mṛgadāya, P. Migadāya) at Sārnāth. He taught the four noble truths to a group of five recluses, who became the first members of his Saṅgha "Assembly". He continued his teaching activities for forty-five years. Two monasteries, Veṇuvana/Veḷuvana (Bamboo Park)[3] in Rājagṛha (today's

[3] Offered by King Bimbisāra of Magadha.

Rājgir) (capital of Magadha)[4] and Jetavana (Jeta's Park)[5] in Śrāvastī (capital of Kosala),[6] were the main centres of his activity. At the age of eighty, he died at Kuśinagara, where he had lain down between two śāla trees. The followers he had gathered during his teaching life included all social classes of the people.

The birth and death of the Buddha are uncertainly and approximately dated to 508-428 BCE (other proposed dates are 464-384 BCE or 566-486 BCE). The period from his Enlightenment to his death is referred to as the period of **Original Buddhism**.

3. Schism in the Saṅgha and the early Buddhist texts

After the death of the Buddha, two Saṅgha councils (saṃgīti) were convened: the first at Rājagṛha shortly after his death, and the second at Vaiśāli, 100 years later. These two councils were convened by leading monks to determine the Buddha's teachings under the headings of Sūtra or Dharma (teaching) and Vinaya (rules of the

---

[4] Both King Bimbisāra and his son Ajātasattu (Ajatashatru) as successor were great devotees of the Buddha.

[5] Offered by Anāthapiṇḍika who had brought it from the park's owner, Prince Jeta. The park was thus also called Jetavana Anāthapiṇḍikassa-ārāma (Jeta's Park, Anathapindika's Grove).

[6] King Pasenadi. His son Viḍūḍabha (Virudhaka), who later became his successor, committed genocide against the tribe of the Śākya and destroyed Kapilavastu during the Buddha's lifetime.

Saṅgha). Buddhism as it was during this one hundred year period (about 428-300 BCE) is called **Early Buddhism**.

Not long after the second council, the first schism of the Saṅgha into two main branches, Mahāsaṅghika and Sthavira, occurred. It arose mainly out of differences over certain Vinaya rules. Following the first schism, the Buddhist Saṅgha developed further divisions and subdivisions within these two main branches. These early Buddhist schools, traditionally numbering eighteen, existed before the emergence of the early Mahāyāna about 100 BCE. This is called the period of **Sectarian Buddhism** or of the **Early Buddhist Schools**; it is dated about 300-100 BCE. These Early Buddhist schools were later called Hīnayāna (Small-vehicle) by followers of the Mahāyāna (Great vehicle).[7]

One of the schools within the Sthavira branch was the Tāmraśātīya or Vibhajjavāda "the Distinctionist Teaching". This school still flourishes today in Sri Lanka and southeast Asia, calling itself Theravāda "the Teaching of the Elders".

Most of the Buddhist texts belonging to the early schools were early converted from various Prakrits (Middle Indo-Aryan dialects) into "Buddhist Sanskrit". Only the Theravāda has preserved its texts intact in a Prakrit, the so-called Pāli (literally, "text"), which is based on a dialect from the region of Ujjenī (Ujjayanī), capital of Avanti, in western India. According to this Theravāda tradition, the orally transmitted Pāli records were first

[7] Regarding these early splits in the Saṅgha, see the diagram, "The First Five Centuries of Buddhism" in Choong (2000), p. 5.

systemically written down by monks during the reign of King Vaṭṭagāmaṇī (29-17 BCE) of Sri Lanka. Other Buddhist texts of the different schools were subsequently lost, but major portions are preserved in Chinese translations, though a few Sanskrit and Prakrit fragments, and Tibetan texts also exist. Both the Pāli and Chinese texts comprise the so-called "Three baskets" Tripiṭaka: Sūtra, Vinaya, and Abhidharma. Only the collections of Sūtra and Vinaya piṭakas represent early Buddhist texts and are directly relevant to the study of Early and Original Buddhism.

The Vinaya piṭaka is the collection of Saṅgha rules. The Sūtra (P. Sutta) piṭaka consists of the five Pāli Nikāyas and the Chinese translations of the four Āgamas.

The five Nikāyas are:

(1) Dīgha-nikāya
(2) Majjhima-nikāya
(3) Saṃyutta-nikāya
(4) Aṅguttara-nikāya
(5) Khuddaka-nikāya

Corresponding to the first four Nikāyas are the four Āgamas preserved in Chinese translation, mostly from Sanskrit, as follows:

(1) Saṃyuktāgama (雜阿含經), which is the counterpart of Saṃyutta-nikāya, translated by Guṇabhadra (求那跋陀羅) in the fifth century CE (two of the fifty fascicles have been lost).

(2) Madhyamāgama (中阿含經), which corresponds to Majjhima-nikāya, translated by Saṃghadeva (僧伽提婆) in the fourth century. These two Āgamas are recognised as belonging to the Sarvāstivādin school.
(3) Dīrghāgama (長阿含經), which is the counterpart of Dīgha-nikāya, translated by Buddhayaśas (佛陀耶舍) and Zhu Fo Nian (竺佛念) in the fifth century. This text belongs to the Dharmaguptaka school.
(4) Ekottarāgama (增壹阿含經), which corresponds roughly to Aṅguttara-nikāya, translated by Dharmanandi (曇摩難提) and revised by Saṃghadeva (僧伽提婆) in the fourth century. It belongs to the Mahāsaṅghika school, and already contains Mahāyāna ideas.

Besides these, there is a Chinese "Additional translation of the Saṃyuktāgama" (別譯雜阿含經), which is an incomplete translation of part of the Saṃyuktāgama. This text may belong to the Kāśyapīya shool. Finally, there are Chinese versions of many individual sutras from all four Āgamas.

The extant early Buddhist texts in Pāli and Chinese versions are mixed with sectarian and later components. They are not entirely the same, in terms of form and content, as at the first and second councils in the period of Early Buddhism. In order to understand Early and Original Buddhism, we need to study them comparatively.

4. Summary

The Śramaṇa movement, which occurred in the central region of the Ganges, was seen as unorthodox by Brahmanism; it questioned the teachings of the Vedas, Brāhmaṇas, and the early Upaniṣads. The Buddha, who was born in the period of this Śramaṇa movement, made his own findings regarding suffering, its arising, freedom from it, and the way to this freedom. Brahmanism, in particular the early Upaniṣads, and Śramaṇa movement, are important areas for understanding the rise of Buddhism.

Because the extant early Buddhist texts are mixed with sectarian and later components, in order to obtain accurate and more certain knowledge of the beginnings of Buddhism, it is important to undertake critical comparative study of the Pāli and Chinese versions of the early Buddhist canon.

Appendix 2:

Definitions of Taṇhā (Craving) in Early Buddhist Sutras

The Pali term *taṇhā*, usually translated "craving", represents an important concept in early Buddhism. Taṇhā is identified as an immediate cause of the arising of dukkha, suffering. The Pali word *taṇhā*, literally meaning "thirst", corresponds to the Sanskrit *tṛṣṇā*, which occasionally appears in the fragmentary remains of central Asian Sanskrit texts corresponding to the Pali sutras. In the Chinese counterparts of the Pali sutras, the term *taṇhā* is represented by the character 愛 ai, literally "love, desire". In this paper I examine definitions of taṇhā or ai contained in the Pali sutras and their Chinese (and Sanskrit) counterparts. My purpose is not to clarify this doctrinal concept, but rather to demonstrate the importance of considering the Chinese texts alongside the Pali in any study of the teachings of early Buddhism.[1]

Unlike the fragmentary Sanskrit remains, the Chinese Buddhist canon contains a complete counterpart for each of the Pali nikāyas. These appear to represent three (possibly even four) different schools of early Buddhism. For the Pali Dīghanikāya (DN) we have a

[1] This paper was presented to the annual conference of the Australian Association for the Study of Religions on 6th July 2003, in the Multi-Faith Centre at Griffith University (Brisbane, Australia).

Chinese Dīrghāgama (DA),[2] believed to represent the Dharmaguptaka school; for the Pali Majjhimanikāya (MN) and Saṃyuttanikāya (SN), we have the Chinese Madhyamāgama (MA)[3] and Saṃyuktāgama (SA)[4] respectively, both thought to be Sarvāstivādin; and for the Pali Aṅguttaranikāya (AN), there is the Chinese Ekottarāgama (EA),[5] thought to represent the Mahāsaṅghika branch of early Buddhism. These four Chinese collections were translated independently from Sanskrit or Prakrit originals about the fourth to fifth centuries CE. In short, each of the four Pali nikāyas (SN, MN, DN, AN) has a Chinese counterpart (SA, MA, DA, EA). I shall demonstrate the importance of these Chinese counterparts as an alternative source of information about the teachings of early Buddhism by examining one particular piece of doctrine: definitions of craving.

---

[2]長阿含經 (T 1, No. 1) translated by Buddhayaśas (佛陀耶舍) and Zhu Fo Nian (竺佛念) in the fifth century CE.
[3]中阿含經 (T 1, No. 26) translated by Saṃghadeva (僧伽提婆) in the fourth century CE.
[4]雜阿含經 (T 2, No. 99) translated by Guṇabhadra (求那跋陀羅) in the fifth century CE (two of the fifty fascicles have been lost). Cf. Choong (2000), pp. 6, 16.
[5]增一阿含經 (T 2, No. 125) translated by Dharmanandi (曇摩難提) and revised by Saṃghadeva (僧伽提婆) in the fourth century CE.

Definitions of *craving*

(1) We look first at the Pali SN 12. 2 and its Chinese counterpart SA 298. In SN 12. 2 craving is explained as being of six types (cha taṇhākāyā):[6]

> craving for visible things (rūpa-taṇhā)
> craving for sounds (sadda-taṇhā)
> craving for odours (gandha-taṇhā)
> craving for tastes (rasa-taṇhā)
> craving for tangible things (phoṭṭhabba-taṇhā)
> craving for mental objects (ideas) (dhamma-taṇhā)

The corresponding Chinese text, SA 298, specifies craving as being of three types (三愛):[7]

> craving for sensuality (欲愛)
> craving for material form (色愛)
> craving for non-materiality (無色愛)

The fragmentary Sanskrit counterpart of this Chinese sutra (SA 298) lists the same three (tisras tṛṣṇāḥ), namely: kāmatṛṣṇā, rūpatṛṣṇā, ārūpyatṛṣṇā.[8] Thus, the Pali SN 12. 2 disagrees with its Chinese counterpart SA 298 (and with the Sanskrit as well) regarding the definition of *craving*.

---

[6] SN ii, p. 3.
[7] T 2, p. 85c (CSA ii, p. 39).
[8] Tripāṭhī, p. 161

(2) The *six classes of craving* specified in SN 12. 2 (above) do appear elsewhere in the Chinese SA;[9] in several Chinese sutras we find the term liu ai-shen (六愛身) "the six classes/groups of craving", explained as:

> craving born of eye-contact (眼觸生愛)
> craving born of ear-contact (耳觸生愛)
> craving born of nose-contact (鼻觸生愛)
> craving born of tongue-contact (舌觸生愛)
> craving born of body-contact (身觸生愛)
> craving born of mind-contact (意觸生愛)

This appears to be identical in signification with the explanation cited earlier from SN 12. 2.[10] On the other hand, the *three cravings* (三愛) specified in SA 298 (above)[11] are not found anywhere in SN. Thus, only the teaching of the *six classes of craving* is shared between SN and SA.

(3) The teaching of six classes/groups of craving (六愛身) found in SA, is present also in two other Chinese agamas, MA and DA;[12] and it is found also in the Pali DN.[13]

---

[9] E.g. in Liu-ruchu Xiangying (六入處相應), SA 276, 304, 330: T 2, pp. 74c, 86-7a, 92a-b (CSA i, pp. 363, 383-384, 410), and in Ru-jie-yin Xiangying (入界陰相應), SA 892: T 2, p. 224c (CSA iii, p. 553).
[10] See also SN 18. 8 and 18: SN ii, pp. 248, 251.
[11] The three cravings in SA 298 are also found in SA 373, 895: T 2, pp. 102c, 225a (CSA ii, p. 93; iii, p. 555).
[12] MA: T 1, p. 562c and DA: T 1, p. 51c.

Similarly, the *three cravings* (三愛) attested in SA 298 are found also in MA.[14] Although these are not found in the Pali SN, they do make a unique appearance in DN, as tisso taṇhā: kāma-taṇhā, rūpa-taṇhā, arūpa-taṇhā".[15]

(4) *Craving* is also explained elsewhere in SN as the following three:

> craving for sensuality (kāma-taṇhā),
> craving for existence (bhava-taṇhā),
> craving for non-existence (vibhava-taṇhā).[16]

However, these three are not found in the corresponding collection, SA.

(5) The three kinds of *craving* specified in the above SN version (item 4) are also found in other Chinese agamas,

---

[13] DN 33, 34: DN iii, pp. 244, 280; DN 15, 22: DN ii, pp. 58, 308, 310.
[14] MA 29, 114: T 1, pp. 463a, 603a. See also T No. 12: T 1, p. 227c.
[15] DN 33: DN iii, p. 216. According to G. C. Pande's historical stratification, DN 33 is "undoubtedly very late" (*Studies in the Origins of Buddhism*, 1957; Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi, 1995, p. 113).
[16] SN 22. 103, 105: SN iii, pp. 158-159; SN 22. 22, 31: SN iii, pp. 26, 32; SN 38. 10: SN iv, p. 257; SN 56. 11, 13, 14: SN v, pp. 421, 425, 426.

namely DA and EA (at EA 49.5).[17] However, these are not found in the corresponding Pali collections (DN and AN). Also, SN 12. 2 and SA 298, which are the counterparts of EA 49. 5, record different accounts of *craving* (see item 1, above).

Finally, (6) yet another variant appears in MA, where it is stated that craving is of two kinds: craving for sensuality and craving for existence (kāma-taṇhā, bhava-taṇhā)[18] – that is, two out of the three kinds of *craving* specified in the SN version (4).

To summarise, altogether four definitions of *craving* are found in the four principal nikāyas and āgamas:

1. Craving for each of the six senses (found in SN-SA, MA, DN-DA)
2. Craving for sensuality, for material form, and for non-materiality (SA, MA, DN)
3. Craving for sensuality, for existence, and for non-existence (SN, DA, EA)
4. Craving for sensuality, and for existence (MA)

Only the first definition (six classes) is common to corresponding collections (nikāyas/āgamas): SN-SA and

---

[17] DA 9, 10, 11, 13: T 1, pp. 50a, 53a, 57c, 60c. EA 49. 5: T 2, p. 797c, the other Chinese counterpart of SN 12. 2 and SA 298.

[18] MA 97: T 1, p. 579b. See also T No. 14, and T No. 52: T 1, pp. 243a, 845a.

DN-DA. The other three definitions are found in different collections.[19]

Conclusion

In this paper I do not intend to draw any conclusion regarding which definition(s) of *craving* identified here belong to the earliest period of Buddhism, and which represent purely sectarian doctrines or relatively late developments. Nevertheless, the above findings based on comparison of Pali and Chinese (including fragmentary Sanskrit) versions of the early Buddhist sutras enable us to see which components of the teaching are shared and which are unshared, between the different collections and sutras. The findings also raise significant questions about the relative antiquity of the four definitions of *craving* identified – questions that merit further investigation.

The main point to be made is that little further progress can be made in any study of the historical development of early Buddhism if one relies exclusively on the Pali canon. The Pali canon represents only one of the early Buddhist schools (the Vibhajjavāda). In order to gain historical depth, one has to consider the texts of other schools (Sarvāstivāda, Dharmaguptaka, Mahāsaṅghika), by comparing the Pali versions with their Chinese counterparts. Such Pali-Chinese comparison ought to become standard practice in studies of Early Buddhism.

---

[19] Cf. Choong (2000), p. 167.

Bibliography

1. Primary Texts

Aṅguttara-nikāya, 6 vols. (PTS, London, 1885-1910).

CBETA. Chinese Electronic *Tripiṭaka* Series: *Taishō Tripiṭaka* CD version (Chinese Buddhist Electronic Text Association, Taiwan, 2007).

Dīgha-nikāya, 3 vols. (PTS, London, 1889-1910).

Majjhima-nikāya, 4 vols. (PTS, London, 1888-1924).

Saṃyutta-nikāya, 6 vols. (PTS, London, 1884-1904).

佛光大藏經雜阿含經 Foguang *Dazangjing Za-ahan Jing* (Foguang *Tripiṭaka Saṃyuktāgama*), 4 vols.(佛光出版社 Foguang Publisher, Kao-hsiung, August 1983).

雜阿含經 *Za-ahan Jing* (*Saṃyuktāgama*), T vol. 2, no. 99 (新文豐出版社 Xinwenfeng Publisher, Taipei, reprinted 1983).

雜阿含經論會編 Za-*ahan Jinglun Huibian* [Combined Edition of *Sūtra* and *Śāstra* of the *Saṃyuktāgama*], 3 vols., compiled by 印順 Yin Shun (March 1983; 正聞出版社 Zhengwen Chubanshe, Taipei, reprinted 1991).

雜阿含經論會編附錄：雜阿含經 · 經論會編對照表 *Za-ahan Jinglun Huibian Fulu*: *Za-ahan Jing · Jinglun Huibian Duizhaobiao* [A Comparative Table of *Za-ahan Jing* and *Jinglun Huibian*] (Zhengwen Chubanshe , 1998).

增一阿含經 *Zengyi-ahan Jing* (*Ekottarāgama*), T vol. 2, no. 125 (Xinwenfeng Publisher, Taipei, reprinted

1983).
長阿含經 *Zhang-ahan Jing* (*Dīrghāgama*), T vol. 1, no. 1. (Xinwenfeng Publisher, Taipei, reprinted 1983).
中阿含經 *Zhong-ahan Jing* (*Madhyamāgama*), T vol. 1, no. 26. (Xinwenfeng Publisher, Taipei, reprinted 1983).

2. General references

Bhikkhu Bodhi (trans.), *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha: A New Translation of the Saṃyutta Nikāya* (Boston, 2000).
Choong, Mun-keat (Wei-keat), *The Notion of Emptiness in Early Buddhism* (Singapore, 1995; second revised edition, Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi, 1999). Reviewed by Roderick S. BUCKNELL, *Australian Religion Studies Review*, vol. 13, no. 1 (Autumn 2000), pp. 100-102.
------ *The Fundamental Teachings of Early Buddhism: A comparative study based on the Sūtrāṅga portion of the Pāli Saṃyutta-Nikāya and the Chinese Saṃyuktāgama* (= Beiträge zur Indologie Band 32) (Harrassowitz Verlag, Wiesbaden, 2000).
Dhammajoti (法光), Bhikkhu Kuala Lumpur, *The Chinese Dharmapada* (Man Fatt Lam Buddhist Temple, Singapore, 1990).
Grönbold, Günter, *Der buddhistische Kanon: eine Bibliographie* (Harrassowitz Verlag, Wiesbaden, 1984).
Hopkins, Thomas J., *The Hindu Religious Tradition* (Wadsworth Publishing Company, California, 1971).

Kulke, Hermann and Rothermund, Dietmar, *A History of India* (1986; Routledge, London and New York, reprinted 1995).

Lamotte, Étienne, "Trois Sūtra du *Saṃyukta* sur la Vacuité" *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, 36 (1973), pp. 313-323. English version (tr. Sara WEBB-BOIN): "Three Sūtras from the *Saṃyuktāgama* concerning Emptiness", *Buddhist Studies Review*, vol. 10/1 (1993), pp. 1-23.

Mizuno, Kōgen (水野弘元), '雑阿含経の研究と出版' Zōagonkyō no Kenkyū to Shuppan [Studies and Publication on *Saṃyuktāgama*], *Bukkyō Kenkyū*, no.17 (1988), pp. 1-45.

Nagasaki, Hōjun (長崎法潤); Kaji, Yoichi (加治洋一), '雑阿含経解題' Zōagonkyō Kaidai [Explanatory notes of the Chinese SA (Taishō 99)], 雑阿含経 I, 新国訳大蔵，阿含部 4 *Zōagonkyō 1, Shinkokuyakudaizōkyō Agonbu 4* [The New Japanese Translation of the Chinese SA (Taishō 99) vol. 1, *Āgamas* no. 4]. (Daizoshuppan, Tokyo, 2004), pp. 5-63.

Pande, Govind Chandra, *Studies in the Origins of Buddhism* (1957; Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi, 1995).

Radhakrishnan, Sarvepalli (ed. and trans.), *The Principal Upanisads* (George Allen and Unwin, London, 1953).

Rhys Davids, C. A. F., *The Book of Kindred Sayings* (SN) 5vols. (PTS, London, reprinted 1975-1980).

Tripāṭhī, Chandrabhāl, *Fünfundzwanzig Sūtras des Nidānasaṃyukta* (Akademie-Verlag, Berlin, 1962).

Yin Shun (印順), 原始佛教聖典之集成 *Yuanshi Fojiao Shengdian zhi Jicheng* [The Formation of Early Buddhist Texts] (Zhengwen Chubanshe, Taipei, 1971).

------ 印度佛教思想史 *Yindu Fojiao Sixiang Shi* [A History of the Thought of Indian Buddhism] (1988; Zhengwen Chubanshe, Taipei, 1993).

假使有世间，正见增上者，

虽复千百生，终不堕恶趣。

《杂阿含经 No. 788》